



House of Commons

Digital, Culture, Media and
Sport Committee

Changing Lives: the social impact of participation in culture and sport

Eleventh Report of Session 2017–19

*Report, together with formal minutes relating
to the report*

*Ordered by the House of Commons
to be printed 7 May 2019*

HC 734

Published on 14 May 2019
by authority of the House of Commons

The Digital, Culture, Media and Sport Committee

The Digital, Culture, Media and Sport Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the expenditure, administration and policy of the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport and its associated public bodies.

Current membership

[Damian Collins MP](#) (*Conservative, Folkestone and Hythe*) (Chair)

[Clive Efford MP](#) (*Labour, Eltham*)

[Julie Elliott MP](#) (*Labour, Sunderland Central*)

[Paul Farrelly MP](#) (*Labour, Newcastle-under-Lyme*)

[Simon Hart MP](#) (*Conservative, Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire*)

[Julian Knight MP](#) (*Conservative, Solihull*)

[Ian C. Lucas MP](#) (*Labour, Wrexham*)

[Brendan O'Hara MP](#) (*Scottish National Party, Argyll and Bute*)

[Rebecca Pow MP](#) (*Conservative, Taunton Deane*)

[Jo Stevens MP](#) (*Labour, Cardiff Central*)

[Giles Watling MP](#) (*Conservative, Clacton*)

Powers

The Committee is one of the departmental select committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No 152. These are available on the internet via www.parliament.uk.

Publication

© Parliamentary Copyright House of Commons 2019. This publication may be reproduced under the terms of the Open Parliament Licence, which is published at www.parliament.uk/copyright.

Committee reports are published on the Committee's website at www.parliament.uk/dcmscom and in print by Order of the House.

Evidence relating to this report is published on the [inquiry publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

Committee staff

The current staff of the Committee are Chloe Challender (Clerk), Mems Ayinla (Second Clerk), Mubeen Bhutta (Second Clerk), Joe Watt (Second Clerk), Lois Jeary (Committee Specialist), Andy Boyd (Senior Committee Assistant), Keely Bishop (Committee Assistant), Lucy Dargahi (Media Officer) and Anne Peacock (Senior Media and Communications Officer).

The Committee would like to thank the specialist adviser for this inquiry, Dr Dave O'Brien (Chancellor's Fellow in Cultural and Creative Industries, University of Edinburgh).

Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Digital, Culture, Media and Sport Committee, House of Commons, London SW1A 0AA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 6188; the Committee's email address is cmscom@parliament.uk

You can follow the Committee on Twitter using [@CommonsCMS](#).

Contents

Summary	3
Introduction	4
1 Breaking the cycle of crime	6
The Brandon Estate, Southwark, London	7
Sport and criminal justice	8
Independent review of sport in youth and adult prisons	9
Sport and desistance from crime	12
Culture and criminal justice	13
2 Creating opportunities through education	17
Culture and education	17
Culture and the school curriculum	20
Measuring cultural education	22
Funding cultural education	23
Sport and education	24
Sport in the school curriculum	26
Primary PE and Sport Premium	27
3 Improving health and wellbeing	29
Social prescribing	30
Sport and health	32
Social prescribing	34
4 Regenerating communities	35
Hull City of Culture 2017	36
Case study: coastal communities	36
Building legacies	37
5 Maximising social impact	39
Cross-government working	39
The power of football	40
Funding, commissioning and evaluation	43

Appendix 1: Research from young people	45
Conclusions and recommendations	46
Formal minutes	51
Witnesses	52
Published written evidence	53
List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament	60

Summary

Cultural and sporting opportunities have intrinsic value, and can inspire personal success, but to view them only this narrowly would be to fail to understand their true value. Organisations working in these fields are doing so much more. Our inquiry showcases some of the evidence that we received, demonstrating the impact of culture and sport on positive outcomes in health, education, criminal justice and urban regeneration.

But much of the excellent, life-changing work we heard about is on a precarious footing. The Government must recognise and harness social impact. Sports and culture must be better integrated within the work and policy objectives of the Department for Education, the Department of Health and Social Care, and the Ministry of Justice, to ensure that everyone can benefit from these opportunities. In the same way that sporting and cultural organisations see social impact as their core business, the Government should see sports and culture as a mainstream way of delivering their social policy goals.

The footprint of the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport means it is in an excellent position to co-ordinate Government thinking in this area, including maximising the opportunities from forthcoming major cultural and sporting occasions.

Introduction

1. Culture and sport are crucial to our national life. The UK has a rich cultural sector, including 40,000 community choirs, 11,000 amateur orchestras, 50,000 amateur arts groups, 5,000 amateur theatre societies, 3,000 dance groups, 2,500 museums, 400 historic places, 4,000 libraries, 1,300 theatres and 50,000 book clubs.¹ In 2017/18, four-fifths of adults in England engaged with the arts, three-quarters visited a heritage site and half attended a museum or gallery.²

2. However, overall levels of cultural participation have not altered significantly in the last five years, and there are significant variations in engagement according to gender, ethnicity, disability, age, socioeconomic group and geographical location.³ The lack of diversity of participants, and of the cultural workforce, were key concerns running throughout the evidence that we received. Deborah Williams, Executive Director of the Creative Diversity Network, emphasised the importance of countering the presumption that culture is “an elite space” to unlock participation and representation from a broader range of people.⁴

3. The UK has a long tradition of sporting excellence. Over 70 major sporting events have been staged since the London 2012 Olympic and Paralympic Games, and sport contributes more than £39 billion to the economy each year.⁵ But elite sport and high-profile success is only one part of the story when it comes to sporting participation. The 2015 cross-government *Sporting Future* strategy introduced a new focus on ensuring that public funding for sports and physical activity is explicitly linked to delivering the social outcomes of physical wellbeing, mental wellbeing, individual development, social and community development, and economic development.⁶ This has been a key focus for our inquiry.

4. More than six out of ten adults are achieving the recommended physical activity level of 150 minutes a week.⁷ However, there has been little change in levels of physical activity since 2015, and there are important variations in levels of activity according to ethnicity, age, disability, gender and socioeconomic group. Sport England, the arms-length public body that aims to drive up sports participation, is focusing resources on under-represented groups.⁸ Some 72% of adults who are physically active agree with the subjective measure of wellbeing that they are ‘satisfied with their lives nowadays’ compared to 65% of adults who are inactive.⁹

5. We launched this inquiry in 2018 to understand how participation in these activities can support wider social goals. We were particularly interested in looking at how social impact can be measured, what existing cultural and sporting programmes are achieving, and the role that the Government could play in helping the wider benefits of culture and sport to be realised in the UK.

1 Dr Daisy Fancourt [SCS0248] para 1.1

2 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [Taking part 2017/18 quarter 4 release](#) August 2018

3 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [SCS0202]

4 Q2

5 HM Government [Sporting Future: a new strategy for an active nation](#) December 2015

6 Ibid

7 [Sport England Active Lives Adult Survey November 2017/18 report](#) April 2019

8 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [SCS0202], Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [SCS0259]

9 Ibid

6. During the inquiry we heard about a range of impressive initiatives that are having a positive effect on people across the country. This report details some of what we have heard and seen, and identifies the steps that the Government needs to take to maximise the positive contribution that both culture and sport have to make to providing opportunities for young people, to maintaining health, creating better places to live and work, and supporting people who might otherwise be at risk of offending.
7. We received an unusually high volume of written submissions, testament to the huge range of cultural and sporting provision taking place across the country. In turn this only represents a fraction of what is going on. While this report showcases some of the evidence that we received, we cannot hope to do justice to either all the initiatives that we heard about, or the far larger breadth and social value of sporting and cultural activity across the UK.
8. Arguably the most important finding from this inquiry is that there is no dispute about the positive social impact of participation in culture and sport. The question then is, why isn't more done across Government to harness the power of culture and sport to address long-standing social problems?
9. The recommendations in this report are two-fold, focussed on specific successful uses of culture and sport in tackling criminal justice, education and health issues, as well as transforming our towns and cities. This report details what we heard from those who took part in our inquiry and makes recommendations about how to further maximise the contribution of culture and sport in each of those specific areas. The second part of our report addresses the issue at the heart of this inquiry: how could better cross-government working deliver greater social impact from sport and culture, and what role should the DCMS play?

1 Breaking the cycle of crime

10. Since the launch of this inquiry in January 2018, there has been growing concern about rising levels of violent crime, and in particular gang-related knife offences. Home Office figures for the year to the end of March 2018 show that 285 people were victims of knife-related homicides in England and Wales, the highest level since 1946; and one in four of these victims were men aged between 18 and 24.¹⁰ In London, there were 132 reported homicides in 2018, the highest level for ten years; and 76 of these deaths were caused by stabbing.¹¹ There are concerns that these statistics demonstrate not just increased levels of dangerous criminal activity, but broader social failings at a community level, in addition to the all too high likelihood of convicts re-offending after their release from prison, with the high social and economic costs this brings as well.

11. The Centre for Social Justice (CSJ) noted in their report on tackling violence and gang-related offending that:

young people need to feel like they are understood and that they have a sense of security in their relationships with others. It is necessary that young people, who may otherwise be susceptible to gang membership, know that there is an alternative community that is available and willing to offer them comprehensive support.¹²

12. The CSJ's report highlights the importance of community partnerships to create a sense of belonging for young people, through sports and other cultural activities. Previous studies have also demonstrated the power of sport and culture to help provide an 'alternative community' for young people who might be otherwise be vulnerable to becoming involved in gang violence and criminality, or unable to break their cycle of re-offending following prior convictions. A report commissioned by the Laureus Sport for Good Foundation highlighted the positive benefits of sport in tackling youth crime and anti-social behaviour, especially for young people who are difficult to engage in other ways.¹³

13. Rugby club Saracens' Sports Foundation has developed the 'Get Onside' programme which works at HMP Feltham Young Offenders Institute in west London. Whilst the re-offending rate for young people in England and Wales one year after their release from a custodial sentence is over 40%,¹⁴ 'Get Onside' has seen just 15% of its participants reoffend since the programme was launched in 2011.¹⁵ Key4Life, a charity which works to rehabilitate young people in prison using art, music and sports has been assessed by the Ministry of Justice as creating programmes which leave participants significantly less likely to re-offend.¹⁶ In written evidence to our inquiry, Arts Council England states that the Summer Arts Colleges it supports alongside the Youth Justice Board, have helped high-risk young people to reintegrate into education, training and employment. The programme reached

10 BBC News [Ten charts on the rise of knife crime in England and Wales](#) 14 March 2019

11 The Guardian [London killings in 2018: how homicides in the capital rose to a decade high](#) 14 January 2019

12 Centre for Social Justice [It Can Be Stopped; a proven blueprint to stop violence and tackle gang and related offending in London and beyond](#) August 2018

13 Laureus Sport for Good Foundation [Teenage Kicks: the value of sport in tackling youth crime](#) 27 September 2012

14 Youth Justice Board/Ministry of Justice [Youth Justice Statistics 2017/18: England and Wales](#) 31 January 2019

15 Saracens Sports Foundation [Work in prisons](#) [accessed on 30 April 2019]

16 Key4Life [Ministry of Justice data lab validates Key4Life's programme as participants are significantly less likely to reoffend](#) [accessed on 30 April 2019]

more than 2,000 young people in England and Wales, and reoffending rates among young people were 54%, compared to the national re-offending rate of 72%. In addition, 90% of young people completing the programme have gone on to achieve an Arts Award.¹⁷

The Brandon Estate, Southwark, London

14. As part of our inquiry, the Committee held an informal meeting at the Kennington Park Centre, which serves the Brandon Estate in Southwark. This London borough had the highest number of homicides in 2018, including the murder of seventeen-year-old Rhyhiem Ainsworth Barton in May that year, who lived in the neighbourhood of the Brandon Estate. The Committee’s meeting was organised with the help of local resident Vince Owusu-Appiah, who approached us following the death of Rhyhiem, sharing his concerns about the dangers to young people, how music and sports could provide a constructive influence on their lives, and how positive role models could lead them away from involvement with gangs. The meeting was also attended by the Black Prince Community Trust, a local Kennington charity which uses football, boxing, athletics, basketball and other sports to deliver a range of beneficial social outcomes for young people. These include improving health and wellbeing, mental health, social inclusion, and youth intervention by “challenging anti-social behaviour including gang culture; providing divisionary programmes and activities in both sport and education to engage and sustain young people in positive activities; and offer young people pathways to education, training or employment.”¹⁸

15. Other local sports initiatives were also cited at the meeting, including ‘Divert’, a scheme delivered in partnership in south London between the Metropolitan Police and local football coaches, where young people in custody between the ages of 18–25 are presented with potentially life-changing opportunities.¹⁹ From November 2016 to July 2018, Divert supported 342 young people. Of these, 8% have since reoffended, which is 22% lower than the average for adult offenders across the capital.²⁰ In November 2018, the Home Secretary, Rt Hon Sajid Javid MP, announced that Divert would be one of the 29 recipients of financial support from the £17.7 million Early Intervention Youth Fund.²¹

16. Community sports facilities on the Brandon Estate itself are limited. The local junior football team, Unity FC, run by coach Peter Baffour, trains all year round on the open grass sports fields in Kennington Park, and is unable to afford to use the floodlit astro-turf pitches next to them. Despite their limited resources, the team not only trains a large number of local players, but has also helped some of their participants to secure contracts to play in the football academies at professional clubs, including Crystal Palace, Fulham and Millwall.²²

17. The Committee’s visit to the Brandon Estate showed that communities often have a good understanding of the challenges they face, and the positive role that sport and culture can play in changing the life chances of young people. How then can we fund initiatives from the cash rich world of elite sport to support these organisations? *The Government should consider how funding can be made available to community*

17 Arts Council England [SCS0235] para 3.30–3.32

18 Black Prince Trust [Social outcomes](#) [accessed on 30 April 2019]

19 The Voice [Football coaches team up with Met Police to Stop Youth Crime](#) 3 May 2018

20 BBC News [London youth crime project Divert included in £17m fund](#) 11 November 2018

21 Home Office [Home Secretary announces recipients of Early Intervention Youth Fund](#) 10 November 2018

22 The Guardian [Streets of fear: how London death toll reached 100](#) 26 August 2018

*initiatives and organisations to create targeted interventions to help young people who are risk of becoming involved in or the victims of criminal activity. And experienced groups such as Clinks, a membership body for voluntary organisations in the criminal justice sector, might be well-placed to administer such a funding scheme, for instance.*²³

Sport and criminal justice

18. The most compelling testimony we heard about the social impact of sport came from ex-offender John McAvoy, who told us:

I can literally say sport saved my life. It saved me from death and from spending my whole life incarcerated [...] I was the most one-track minded criminal you will ever meet in your lives. I grew up and, honestly, I detested this—I detested the Government, I detested banks, the police. If I have managed to do what I have done with my life and turn my life around, every single one of those 90,000 people in prison today can do exactly the same. That is the power of sport.²⁴

19. The testimony we heard from Mr McAvoy left us in no doubt about the role that sport can play in rehabilitating offenders, helping to reduce reoffending on release from prison and, ultimately, transforming lives.²⁵ But John also told us that if he had served his sentence in a different prison he would not have benefited from the sporting opportunities that have enabled him to change his life. He said, “it was about a man who worked in that prison who reached out to me, who gave me an opportunity and believed in me”.²⁶ Professor Rosie Meek from Royal Holloway University confirmed “it is something of a lottery depending on what prison an individual ends up in”²⁷ and said that examples of good practice should be celebrated because they are “fairly infrequent”²⁸ across the prison estate. Three in ten adult offenders reoffend within one year of release from prison, and four in ten young offenders under the age of 18 reoffend within a year of release.²⁹

20. There is clear interest in the role that sport can play in the prison estate. For example, the Ministry of Justice has worked with parkrun UK to introduce weekly 5km runs within the Adult and Youth prison estate.³⁰ Runs are currently held weekly in seven prisons, with the aim to increase this to 17 by the summer of 2019. Each parkrun requires 19 volunteers, who are typically prisoners supported by prison staff and members of the public. In its first year there have been 313 prisoner volunteers and 1,237 prisoner runners/walkers.

21. While Ministry of Justice Parliamentary Under Secretary of State Edward Argar MP told us that his department holds regular meetings with other Government departments on sport in the prison estate,³¹ the evidence that we heard from former Justice Minister

23 Clinks is the infrastructure organisation supporting voluntary organisations in the criminal justice system in England and Wales. Its aim is to ensure that organisations and the people they support are informed and engaged in order to transform lives and communities. www.clinks.org

24 Q62

25 Q62, Pete Bell also provided the Committee with his personal testimony of how sport enabled him to turn his life around after committing a series of crimes that resulted in a custodial sentence [[SCS0247](#)]

26 Q64

27 Q68

28 Q86

29 Ministry of Justice [A sporting chance: an independent review of sport in youth and adult prisons](#) August 2018

30 Ministry of Justice [[SCS0258](#)]

31 Q271

Dr Phillip Lee MP³² indicated the political attention that sport receives in the Ministry of Justice is down to ministerial postholders. He told us it was “like wading through treacle to get anything done”³³ until a new Secretary of State arrived who was interested in sport within the criminal justice system. The need for a sustained and joined-up approach was also underlined in our written evidence.³⁴

Independent review of sport in youth and adult prisons

22. During the time that our inquiry has been running, Professor Meek of Royal Holloway University has undertaken an independent review of sports provision in youth and adult prisons on behalf of the Ministry of Justice, which was commissioned in September 2017 by Dr Lee, when he was the Justice Minister, and completed in February 2018.³⁵ She found that the utilisation of sport across the prison estate is inconsistent and under-developed, despite the growing evidence that physical activity supports rehabilitation. The review expresses concern that PE and gym provision is often not adequately co-ordinated or implemented in prisons, and that the sports-related learning programmes offered to prisoners are not used to their full potential or at a high enough qualification level to support employment on release. The report states:

now is the time for the Ministry of Justice, HM Prison and Probation Service and Youth Custody Service to work together with partners such as the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport, the Department of Health and Social Care, Department for Education and the Home Office, many of whom are progressing with their own strategies, in order to develop co-ordinated efforts to promote physical activity.³⁶

23. The review recommends that prisons work in closer partnership with sporting groups and community organisations to support offenders in their local area,³⁷ as these organisations have had a tangible impact on reducing reoffending. For example, Chelsea Football Club and Rugby Union academies at HMP and YOI Portland report reoffending rates of 6%, and the Street Soccer Programme at HMP Forest Bank reports reoffending rates of 7%.³⁸ Professor Meek told us:

I feel strongly that we have a network of sports bodies and clubs up and down the country who are very willing to go into our prisons but they are not able to because of various policies or reluctance from prison staff, or simply because prisons do not have the staff to escort and look after these groups. We are missing a huge opportunity there.³⁹

32 In the time between our invitation to Dr Lee and his appearance before our Committee he resigned from his post as Parliamentary Under Secretary of State at the Ministry of Justice.

33 Q65

34 For example 2nd Chance Group [[SCS0117](#)], Fight for Peace [[SCS0138](#)]. This also formed part of the discussion during the Committee’s visit to the Brandon Estate

35 Ministry of Justice [A sporting chance: an independent review of sport in youth and adult prisons](#) August 2018

36 Ministry of Justice [A sporting chance: an independent review of sport in youth and adult prisons](#) August 2018

37 Q80

38 Figures taken from Ministry of Justice [A sporting chance: an independent review of sport in youth and adult prisons](#) August 2018

39 Q121

24. One of the initiatives that we received evidence about is the ‘Onside’ project run by Leeds Rhinos Foundation,⁴⁰ working with offenders at HMP Leeds and Wealstun. The project combines sport, personal development and employability training to help prepare offenders in the final six months of their sentence for successful reintegration into society. Over 60 inmates have successfully completed the 10-week course in its first year, the majority of whom have entered education, training or employment on release and have desisted from crime.

25. Dr Lee commented that most youth offenders are in the community, where sports clubs play a crucial role “in keeping kids on the straight and narrow”.⁴¹ A joined-up approach to sport both in the community and in custody is the most likely to be effective.⁴² While the Ministry of Justice has seen “a significant cut”⁴³ to its budget, Dr Lee told us “I never get the impression there is a lack of money in sport that could be channelled into social action”.⁴⁴ We also heard about examples of the prison service directly funding the infrastructure to enable provision from external organisations.⁴⁵ Parliamentary Under Secretary of State Edward Argar MP told us that the current involvement of sporting clubs in the prison estate is “patchy” due to both the localities where clubs are based and the varying facilities available in different prisons.⁴⁶

26. The Premier League runs the Premier League Works programme in prisons and young offender institutions, working with local football clubs. One participant who was serving a sentence in Feltham Young Offenders Institution, following a conviction for intent to supply drugs, achieved a Level Three Business and Enterprise Award and a Football Association Level One Coaching Qualification after completing the course. He commented: “I knew that if I didn’t do something while I was in Feltham that there was always going to be the chance that once I got out I would reoffend. I needed to create opportunities for myself now because I don’t have a family or support network like others once I am released”.⁴⁷

27. Professor Meek’s review found that, among a number of different sports, boxing “offers a credible alternative to anti-social behaviour for the most disengaged groups” and could be particularly motivating for women and girls in custody.⁴⁸ Fight 4 Peace told us they use boxing and martial arts “because they are high-adrenalin sports that successfully attract and connect with young people for whom risk is normalised”,⁴⁹ while research found that 94% of young offenders in Hertfordshire would be willing to attend a boxing session.⁵⁰ Elycia, a girl who took part in a boxing programme run by youth charity ThinkForward, said: “I used to get angry really quickly and I would punch things.

40 Case study provided by 2nd Chance Group [\[SCS0117\]](#) para 27

41 Q102

42 2nd Chance Group [\[SCS0117\]](#) para 2, Fight 4 Peace [\[SCS0138\]](#) para 3.7

43 Q340

44 Q85

45 parkrun UK [\[SCS0242\]](#) para 15

46 Q334

47 Case study supplied by the Premier League, the Premier League Works programme is run by the Premier League and Princes Trust [\[SCS0134\]](#) paras 28–30

48 Ministry of Justice [A sporting chance: an independent review of sport in youth and adult prisons](#) August 2018

49 Fight 4 Peace [\[SCS0138\]](#) para 2.2

50 Big Lottery Fund [\[SCS0094\]](#) para 18

My hands would hurt and be really badly bruised. I was in hospital a lot, my hands used to bruise so much[...] Boxing really helped me to calm down, it was a way of getting my aggression out.”⁵¹

28. Edward Argar MP told us, however, that the Government had chosen to reject Professor Meek’s recommendation that targeted boxing and martial arts activities should have a place within the custodial system because evidence of the benefits was not sufficiently compelling and there are concerns about the safety of prison staff, despite the fact that the recommendation itself actually called for a carefully designed pilot initiative to inform a new boxing and martial arts policy in prisons.⁵² He told us that he is currently considering whether more work could be done to strengthen the existing evidence base.⁵³

29. The Government’s stance, however, is inconsistent with its previous position when the boxing policy was introduced. It was never intended to be a blanket ban, as this exchange from 2013, involving the then Attorney General and the former Justice Minister and Minister of Sport Gerry Sutcliffe (a member of this Committee at the time), demonstrates:

Mr Gerry Sutcliffe (Bradford South) (Lab): One of the busiest places in prison is the gym. I hope that the Secretary of State will look at how sports can help to reduce reoffending. Will he look at the boxing project in Doncaster prison? It teaches offenders to get involved in boxing and uses boxing coaches. Unfortunately, it has had to be stopped because of a change in the guidelines on boxing in prisons. I understand some of the problems, but the scheme is great and people get jobs at the end of the course.

Chris Grayling: I can give an assurance to the hon. Gentleman. I am aware of the project to which he refers. I have seen a number of projects around the country in which boxing is used as a way of engaging young people. I have no problem with that happening in our prisons. My hon. Friend the Under-Secretary of State for Justice, the hon. Member for Kenilworth and Southam is writing to the hon. Gentleman to say that we are happy for the project to go ahead; our only caveat relates to violent offenders. We are happy to see the project continue as a way of engaging non-violent offenders.⁵⁴

30. After a long delay, Professor Meek’s expert report was eventually published by the Ministry of Justice on 18th August 2018—a quiet Saturday, as the Justice Minister conceded in evidence before us, in the middle of the summer holidays. In advance, it had been the subject of a letter by Conservative Party Chair Brandon Lewis to members of the Government, criticising any change to the ban on boxing or martial arts in prisons. The letter was leaked, prompting predictable tabloid headlines. For his part, Dr Lee strongly condemned the delay in publication and the Government’s knee-jerk rejection to this aspect of the report’s 12 wide-ranging recommendations in all.

51 ThinkForward [[SCS0125](#)] para 23

52 Q331

53 Q323

54 HC Deb 9 January 2013 [Col 326](#) [Commons Chamber]

Sport and desistance from crime

31. Sport can be used to divert young people away from crime, especially those who have limited access to positive adult role models.⁵⁵ While it is, by definition, difficult to measure something that has been prevented, evaluation of Fight 4 Peace’s martial arts programmes shows that, over 12 months, their work resulted in 165 crimes being avoided, delivering an estimated £1 million worth of savings to the Exchequer, and an additional £2.5 million worth of lifetime education and employment impacts.⁵⁶ A cricket programme working in Cotgrave, Nottinghamshire reduced juvenile crime and anti-social behaviour by 76%, resulting in an estimated £1.4 million saving to the public purse.⁵⁷

32. Coaching and mentoring through sport can provide development in a broader sense. John Herriman explained that the work of Greenhouse Sports “is not a diversionary tactic”⁵⁸ aimed at simply occupying young people. The Doorstep Sport programme seeks to build resilience amongst young people who may be at risk of getting drawn into crime, developing their critical thinking and self-control skills when faced with risky choices.⁵⁹

33. One of the key issues to emerge from the discussions we had at the Brandon Estate was the importance of ensuring that young people are aware of the sporting opportunities that are available to them. Many organisations offer free or subsidised activities, so knowledge is the only barrier to participation. John McAvoy made a similar point:

We have a lot of issues in London at the moment with a lot of stabbings. I go into schools and youth facilities and speak to the people that work there. These big vacuums are being created within the city and they are being filled by people who are involved in drugs. They are exploiting and manipulating these young people. I feel that if you had centralised hubs in these areas where young people could go and have exposure to positive male role models, it could change their lives. If I had had that as a child, I would have changed my life.⁶⁰

In the time that we have been undertaking our inquiry the Mayor of London has launched an interactive online map of activities that young Londoners can get involved in, including sports and cultural projects.⁶¹ This is part of the Mayor’s work to tackle youth violence in the city. ConnectSport is an online directory of organisations using sport and physical activity to benefit society.⁶² ukactive, which also submitted evidence, is an umbrella body promoting physical activity, including more extensive use of school sports facilities during holiday periods, with a pilot programme presently targeting inactivity in the summer, holiday hunger, learning loss and other personal and mental health issues in young people.⁶³

34. The delay in publishing the independent review of sport in youth and adult prisons demonstrates the precarious political capital invested in sport and criminal justice. The life-changing opportunities offered by sport like those afforded to John

55 Q136

56 Fight 4 Peace [SCS0138] para 1.2

57 England and Wales Cricket Board [SCS0107]

58 Q5

59 Streetgames [SCS0064] para 10

60 Q90

61 Mayor of London #OurLondonMap [accessed on 30 April 2019]

62 Connectsport [SCS0186]

63 ukactive [SCS0128]

McAvoy cannot be left to chance. *There is a suspicion that Government is influenced still by wariness of press headlines suggesting that use of sport in the justice system is inappropriate. The Government must rebut robustly these suggestions. The Ministry of Justice should establish permanent cross-government structures to focus action on sport and criminal justice, and add this to the list of ministerial responsibilities in the Department.*

35. *During 2019, the Government has committed to monitor progress on the recommendations made in Professor Meek’s report. This work should involve both the MoJ and DCMS and also be subject to independent scrutiny. It is regrettable that coverage of this wide-ranging review was overshadowed by press leaks about one aspect—the potential role of boxing and martial arts in prisons. Rather than rejecting the suggestion out of hand, the review should also include a comprehensive evaluation of their place among other sports helping rehabilitation and stopping re-offending, both within the prison estate and in the community.*

36. *Violent incidents in prisons appear to be at an all-time high and the report’s recommendations reflect the need to consider alternative violence reduction strategies. Given the positive impact of boxing and martial arts programmes in our communities, as reflected in the evidence we have received, prison governors should be given the option of using similar approaches in their establishments, if they so wish. The review should also identify the measures needed to more systematically harness the significant contribution that sporting clubs are making to reducing reoffending in their communities. It is vital, in particular, that MoJ and HM Prison and Probation Service provides the leadership to make wide-ranging and high quality sports and physical education provision a reality—including effective liaison with local clubs and national initiatives—with a senior prison manager taking responsibility at each establishment.*

37. *In January 2019, HM Prison and Probation Service updated its ‘Strategic Review of Physical Education in Prisons’. Welcome as this was, this replicates a number of Professor Meek’s recommendations, without acknowledging the ‘A Sporting Chance’ report at all. This is a missed opportunity to demonstrate joined-up working and underlines the importance of independent scrutiny to monitor substantive progress in the prison establishment.*

38. *The Ministry of Justice should work with the Home Office, DCMS, Department of Health and DfE to establish the best way to create a nationwide equivalent to the Mayor of London’s map of activities for young people, which could help them to find sporting development opportunities and positive role models.*

Culture and criminal justice

39. The 2016 Culture White Paper recognises the link between culture and criminal justice, noting that there are “many good examples of how cultural interventions can benefit prisoners, ex-offenders and people at risk of becoming involved in crime. Culture can help to improve self-esteem, social skills and wellbeing: all of which help to reduce the risk of offending and re-offending and make our communities safer”.⁶⁴ Arts Council England told us that “arts-based projects for prisoners and those on probation help set

them on a new path, reducing risk of reoffending”.⁶⁵ Between 2012 and 2017 the Arts Council invested £13 million in arts organisations focused on tackling crime and diverting people from committing crime.

40. There are differing views on the evidence base for the effectiveness of the arts in terms of reducing crime, and rehabilitating prisoners. Clinks, a membership body for voluntary organisations in the criminal justice sector, told us that cultural interventions “offer avenues for individuals to interpret and reflect on their involvement in the criminal justice system”,⁶⁶ enabling them to move to more positive behaviour in the future.

41. A 2016 Government review of education in prisons found that the arts can engage prisoners who have had a poor previous experience of formal education, or who struggle with self-esteem.⁶⁷ It recommended that there should be no restrictions on the use of prison education budgets for arts and sport courses.⁶⁸ A separate review of music provision for young offenders and young people at risk of offending found improvements in functional education skills and transferable employment skills, as well as increases in confidence and self-esteem.⁶⁹ Professor Meek commented: “Going into prisons with a range of different types of programmes, be they arts, music or sports-based, is one of the most effective ways of engaging with the most difficult-to-engage-with prisoners.”⁷⁰ Although she stressed the precariousness of funding and the “barriers caused by rigid educational curriculums or lack of attention to individualised plans”⁷¹ facing arts in criminal justice programmes.

42. But Professor Geoffrey Cossick stated “evidence for the effects [of the arts] on re-offending is genuinely unclear”.⁷² While the arts undoubtedly contribute to the personal growth that facilitates a change in behaviour away from reoffending, it is difficult to isolate the arts as a causal factor in this change of behaviour. Professor Cossick suggested that the evidence demonstrates that arts initiatives have been shown to deliver intermediate outcomes such as prisoners developing trust and resilience “and thus begin the journey to becoming a non-offender”.⁷³ In March 2019, a new MoJ publication recognised the importance of such intermediate outcomes, and the need for proper measurement, in arts-based interventions among offenders.⁷⁴

43. Arts organisation Fine Cell Work⁷⁵ enables prisoners to build fulfilling and crime-free lives by training them to do high-quality, skilled, creative needlework undertaken in the long hours spent in their cells to foster hope, discipline and self-esteem. They also guide them towards training and support on release. Currently working in 32 British prisons, and engaging with over 500 prisoners each year, Fine Cell Work addresses key issues affecting prisoners’ offending behaviours: establishment and reinforcement of work skills, building relationships, and mental resilience. On average prisoners taking part spend 24 hours a week crafting.

65 Arts Council England [SCS0235] para 3.27

66 Clinks and the National Criminal Justice Arts Alliance [SCS0121] para 2.5

67 Clinks and the National Criminal Justice Arts Alliance [SCS0121] para 2.9, UK Music [SCS0165] para 16

68 Ministry of Justice [Unlocking potential: a review of education in prison](#) May 2016

69 National Foundation for Youth Music [SCS0150] para 5.1

70 Q68

71 Q145

72 Professor Geoffrey Cossick [SCS0198] para 3c

73 Ibid

74 HM Prison and Probation Service [Developing a toolkit to measure intermediate outcomes to reduce reoffending from arts and mentoring interventions](#) March 2019

75 Case study supplied by Paul Hamlyn Foundation [SCS0012] para 3.5 and Crafts Council [SCS0034] para 2.1.4

44. Cultural organisations can also provide a ‘safe space’ for prisoners after their release, somewhere that they can go without fear of judgement. The Roundhouse told us that a young person who came to them on release said it was “the first place I came to where they didn’t care where I was from or about my past, just what I wanted to do and where I could go. The support they gave me made me want to turn my life around. Now I have a full-time job.”⁷⁶ The Synergy Theatre offers free courses in acting and playwriting for ex-prisoners, reaching over 400 ex-prisoners and people at risk every year. Three-quarters of participants report increased skills, motivation and self-esteem. One participant said “before this course I was very withdrawn and isolated. The process of this course has brought about major change”.⁷⁷ Professor Meek emphasised the importance of involving community organisations as early as possible in rehabilitation in order to provide the necessary support in the critical transition from custody to living in the community. She said “you need to build up that relationship with someone while they are still in prison. By the time they come out, it is almost too late.”⁷⁸

45. The prison librarian at Frankland Prison Durham set up a book group for prisoners⁷⁹ who are being held in one of the highest-security prisons in the UK. The initiative has found that discussion of texts allows prisoners to interact with each other more freely than is possible in other parts of their life in the prison. Literature can also provide a framework for ethical debate, challenging beliefs or norms that may be unhelpful for an offender’s rehabilitation. Prisoners who regularly read are more likely to continue education or find employment after release and are less likely to reoffend.

46. Clinks expressed concern that the impact of the arts is ‘overlooked’ in policy decisions, including within the MoJ.⁸⁰ Arts, Heritage and Tourism Minister Michael Ellis MP told us “the creative arts, theatre and so on, also have a part to play in helping people be less recidivist, less reoffending when they are released from incarceration.”⁸¹ He noted that the DCMS has held ministerial meetings with the MoJ on the issue of art in prisons.⁸² The National Criminal Justice Arts Alliance, Koestler and Clean Break, all organisations supporting high quality arts practice in criminal justice settings, have been part of Arts Council England’s National Portfolio since 2018.⁸³ National Portfolio organisations receive grant funding from the Arts Council England and the National Lottery because their work furthers the Arts Council’s strategic priorities and broader mission to see thriving artforms across England.⁸⁴

47. The DCMS has recognised the role of the arts in reducing reoffending, but the Department’s activity in this area is far less developed than the work championing the role of sport in tackling criminality. This is despite the existence of the National Criminal Justice Arts Alliance, an umbrella organisation representing a large number of groups operating in this sphere. We recommend the DCMS and MoJ jointly commission a review of arts in the prison estate, along a similar model to Professor Meek’s review of sport in youth and adult prisons discussed in Chapter 2.

76 Roundhouse [SCS0215]

77 Big Lottery Fund [SCS0094] para 17, Clinks and the National Criminal Justice Arts Alliance [SCS0121] para 2.2

78 Q131

79 Case study provided by Durham University [SCS0245] para 5.2 and 5.3

80 Clinks and the National Criminal Justice Arts Alliance [SCS0121] para 4.3

81 Q345

82 Q344

83 Department of Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [SCS0202]

84 Arts Council England [Investment narratives 2018–22](#) [accessed on 30 April 2019]

48. The DCMS and Arts Council England should also work with cultural organisations, including National Portfolio organisations to collate and develop the evidence base for the role that the arts can play in behaviour change, reducing reoffending and rehabilitating offenders.

2 Creating opportunities through education

49. Most young people’s experience of cultural and sporting education begins at school, and can vary greatly depending on the institution itself. A 2015 survey estimated that private school students did three times more sport a week than children of the same age at state schools.⁸⁵ Furthermore, according to the Sutton Trust charity, 19% of the people named ‘best solo artist’ at the pop music Brit Awards between 1977 and 2016 went to private schools, compared with 7% of the overall population,⁸⁶ and 44% of undergraduates at the Royal Academy of Music in 2016 came from state schools, lower than the proportion at any university.⁸⁷ Giving evidence to our inquiry mental health campaigner Alastair Campbell said “let us be absolutely frank: the level of sporting provision in state schools, compared with the 7% who use private schools, is a joke. We are nowhere near that level. I would try to get the data as to whether sport, as practised by children educated in private schools with very good sports facilities, is a reason—there are all sorts of other reasons—why they often get better educational attainment across the board. I don’t know, but that is the sort of thing we need to know, because then we can apply that to the state sector as well.”⁸⁸

50. In our inquiry, we examined not only the importance of giving young people the opportunity to develop their interest in sport and culture through their school or college, but also the wider benefits that this can have for their educational attainment as a whole.

Culture and education

51. In the 2016 Culture White Paper, the Government set out an expectation that school pupils would study art and design, music, drama, dance and design and technology, including at GCSE and A level.⁸⁹ The 2011 National Music Plan for Education stated that all children in England should have the opportunity to learn a musical instrument.⁹⁰ Government figures show that, in 2017/18, 96% of children in England aged 5–15 engaged with the arts, either in or out of school.⁹¹ But there are significant variations in the type of activity and whether children were able to participate at school. For example, while children were likely to have taken part in writing, arts and craft and video activities at school, fewer than one in five 11–15 year olds who took part in a street arts, circus or festival event did so through their school.⁹² Uneven and inconsistent access to arts and cultural education was a key point in discussions that we had with young people as part of this inquiry.⁹³ Feversham Primary Academy is a large primary school in Bradford where

85 Headmasters’ and Headmistresses’ [Conference Independent schools do ‘almost triple amount of sports than state counterparts’](#) 24 March 2015

86 Sutton Trust [Top Bafta winners twice as likely to have been to private school as Brit winners](#) 24 February 2016

87 Arts Professional [Specialist arts colleges among the most elitist in the country](#) 9 February 2018

88 Q190

89 Department for Culture, Media and Sport [The Culture White Paper](#) March 2016

90 Department for Education and Department for Culture, Media and Sport [The Importance of Music A National Plan for Music Education](#) 2011

91 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [Taking Part Survey: England Child Report, 2017/18](#) August 2018

92 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [Taking Part Survey: England Child Report, 2017/18](#) 30 August 2018

93 See further details in Appendix 1

the majority of pupils speak English as an additional language.⁹⁴ The school was put in Ofsted special measures in 2012, when it became part of the Academies Enterprise Trust. Headteacher Naveed Idrees has embedded music, drama and art into every part of the school day.

52. Describing this change in strategy Mr Idrees told the Committee that:

Children come to our school with very little life experience, with little or no English, from deprived areas of housing and health. There is only 6% of tertiary education, so the differentiation is quite high. We started with the question: what do these children need? What they needed was to be engaged and music was the vehicle we used because music allows children to see pattern and rhythm. It allows them to engage at a deeper level. We wanted the children to access something beyond the physical. Music is something that allows people to connect on a deeper level.⁹⁵

At Feversham every child receives at least three hours of music a week⁹⁶ and songs are incorporated into other classes, with pupils singing about times tables, or history. This approach has been taken by reallocating the school's existing funding formula,⁹⁷ rather than leveraging additional resources. The school has 98% attendance⁹⁸ and in 2018, 80% of pupils at the school achieved the expected standard in reading, writing and maths, compared to the national average of 64%. Results for disadvantaged pupils were well above average.⁹⁹

53. Cultural participation can help to deliver formal educational outcomes, including raised attainment and greater likelihood of going on to further and higher education.¹⁰⁰ Mr Idrees explained that the introduction of music throughout his school helped them go "from being in the bottom of the league table to being in the top 1%".¹⁰¹ Helen O'Donnell, Chief Executive of the Children's University, told us that an evaluation found that participation in her organisation's programmes led to two months' additional progress in Key Stage 2 maths and reading, with children eligible for Free School Meals making a further month's additional progress in maths.¹⁰²

54. Engagement in the arts can also help children to develop 'soft skills',¹⁰³ including amongst children with special educational needs.¹⁰⁴ On an individual level the impact can be transformative, as this case study from the Northern Ballet's *Start* programme demonstrates:

94 The Guardian [How to improve school result: not extra maths but music, loads of it](#) 3 October 2017

95 Q228

96 BBC News [How a school in Bradford is beating the odds with music](#) 19 September 2018

97 Q231

98 Q240

99 National Statistics [Feversham Primary Academy](#) December 2018

100 Department for Culture, Media and Sport [The Culture White Paper](#) March 2016, Cultural Learning Alliance [SCS0171] para 3, Society of Authors [SCS0240], A New Direction [SCS0071] para 5, Q229, Q236

101 Q228, Q229 and Q230

102 Q244, Children's University [SCS0035] para 7

103 Children's University supplementary evidence [SCS0254] para 7c

104 BALTIC Centre for Contemporary Art [SCS0063], Contemporary Visual Arts Network [SCS0083] para 7, Access Creative College [SCS0051] para 3, Thinkforward [SCS0125] para 6, Yorkshire Sculpture Park [SCS0025]

Start gave him something to talk about and to write about and his support staff a topic that they knew would interest and enthuse him. The whole experience helped John to build relationships with adults and led to a significant shift in this behaviour. John's teacher credits Start with saving John from exclusion.¹⁰⁵

55. Exposure to culture within the education system can also broaden children's horizons and extend opportunities. For example, Tamasha Theatre took Muslim playwrights and directors into London schools to develop short plays with pupils. As well as building confidence and motivation amongst pupils, the project used drama to give both students and audience members insights into Muslim communities.¹⁰⁶ Debbie Lye, Spirit of 2012 Chief Executive, told us about a programme that they have funded engaging children with Shakespeare:

One of the teachers from Walsall said to us that his students would never, ever have met someone who works in a creative career if they had not had that writer in their school, let alone doing the festivals and the pride they get from that. It is that sense of empowerment and doing something different that they never imagined before.¹⁰⁷

56. During the Committee's visit to Manchester in September 2018 we met with the Contact Theatre¹⁰⁸ which has a unique operating model that puts young people at the heart of everything that they do. Young people aged 13–30 sit on the management board and work alongside staff. Their aim is to develop young people as leaders and agents of change in the arts and society. As this is a cultural project being shaped by young people, for young people, their engagement with it is far greater.

57. In addition to this, Contact is partnering with the Battersea Arts Centre, the People's Palace Projects in Glasgow, the National Theatre of Wales and Fablab Belfast, to deliver a project called The Agency, which was initially developed in the Favelas of Rio De Janeiro. With support from the Big Lottery Fund, The Agency awards up to £2,000 to successful bids from young people in marginalized areas, to create social enterprises, events, projects and businesses that will have a positive impact on their local communities. So far these have included setting up arts festivals, supporting music production and teaching English as a foreign language through football.

58. In Manchester, The Agency works in Moston and Harpurhey, areas with high unemployment and low educational attainment. Young people from these communities are involved at every level of decision-making, including determining the artistic programme, setting up and running creative projects, and appointing all staff and trustees. On the Committee's visit to Contact, one of the young people who has been involved in The Agency for seven years told us that it has been "a life changing experience", especially coming from a background where theatre isn't "the done thing".

105 UK Theatre and Society of London Theatre [[SCS0182](#)] para 4.4.4

106 Case study provided by Said Foundation [[SCS0099](#)]

107 Q235

108 Contact [[SCS0126](#)]

59. Contact told us “The Agency has profoundly changed all three of the organisations who are already employing it in the UK. It has changed their purpose; their position within their local communities; how they are seen by local people and organisations; what people think they are for; and how they interact with their neighbours.”¹⁰⁹

60. The educational benefits from the work of cultural organisations extends beyond just children and young people. Lifelong learning was a core mission for many organisations that provided associated specialist activities. This was irrespective of artform, with the Old Royal Naval College,¹¹⁰ High Peak Community Arts,¹¹¹ National Museums Liverpool¹¹² and others noting their post-compulsory and adult educational impacts. Nottingham Contemporary told us their learning programmes reach “families, community groups, young people and students. Engagement programmes focus on working with children and adults facing greatest deprivation. We partner with agencies supporting people who have physical and mental disabilities, drug and alcohol dependency, experienced domestic violence and abuse, homelessness and unemployment”.¹¹³

Culture and the school curriculum

61. The current National Curriculum in England has been operating since 2014. At the primary level, children are expected to study a range of art and design elements including: using drawing, painting and sculpture; using colour, pattern, texture and shape; and observing the work of a range of artists and designers.¹¹⁴ At secondary level, children are expected to develop proficiency in using a range of artistic materials and techniques; evaluate their own work; and study the history of art, craft and design.¹¹⁵

62. There was widespread concern in the evidence that we received about changes to the school curriculum leading to a decline in arts education from early years, through primary and into secondary education.¹¹⁶ The Paul Hamlyn Foundation noted “for many young people, particularly those experiencing the most disadvantage, the only opportunity to gain access to arts education is at school”.¹¹⁷ Rt Hon Nick Gibb MP, Minister for School Standards, told us that the best schools recognise that offering a broad curriculum will lead to excellent academic results, but he conceded “there is often a gap between what the national curriculum says and what is taught in schools”.¹¹⁸

109 Contact [SCS0126] para 6

110 SCS0007

111 SCS0062

112 SCS0073

113 Nottingham Contemporary [SCS0048] para 2.3

114 Department for Education [Art and design programmes of study: key stages 1 and 2 2013](#)

115 Department for Education [Art and design programmes of study: key stage 3 2013](#)

116 Including Crafts Council [SCS0034] paras 3.1–3.4, Action for Children’s Arts [SCS0037] paras 3.1–3.4, Music Education Council [SCS0080] paras 7–11, Paul Hamlyn Foundation [SCS0012] para 2.3, Julian Dennis Rand [SCS0008], Musicians Union [SCS0057], BALTIC Centre for Contemporary Art [SCS0063], Bristol Culture [SCS0069], Karen Cook [SCS0074], Exeter Bach Society [SCS0075], One Dance UK [SCS0086], What Next? Newcastle Gateshead [SCS0092], Institute of Conservation [SCS0097], The Lowry Centre Trust [SCS0122], Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance [SCS0127], National Theatre [SCS0164], UK Music [SCS0165], Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation [SCS0180], Equity [SCS0184], Arvon [SCS0189], Midlands TUC Creative and Leisure Industries Committee [SCS0205], Show Culture Some Love [SCS0206], University of the Arts London [SCS0217], Society of Authors [SCS0240], Aidan Nicol [SCS0249]

117 Paul Hamlyn Foundation [SCS0012] para 2.3, this point was also made by , Music Education Council [SCS0080] para 7 and One Dance UK [SCS0086] para 22

118 Q313

63. Announced in 2010 and introduced in 2013, the English Baccalaureate (EBacc) is a set of core subjects at GCSE level that the Government believes offer greater opportunities for social mobility including proceeding to further and higher education.¹¹⁹ The EBacc comprises English language and literature, maths, the sciences, geography or history and a language. While pupils can take additional subjects, secondary schools are measured on the number of pupils that take GCSEs in these core subjects and the results they achieve.¹²⁰

64. In tandem with our recent Live Music inquiry,¹²¹ we heard particular concerns about the EBacc ‘crowding out’ arts subjects at secondary school level.¹²² In 2018 GCSE entries in EBacc subjects increased by 5% while entries in non-EBacc subjects decreased by 13% compared to 2017.¹²³ The Cultural Learning Alliance estimated that the take up of arts GCSE courses had reduced by 28% since 2010, that there had been a 17% decline in arts subject teaching time and a 16% reduction in specialist secondary school teachers.¹²⁴ Similar concerns have recently been raised by Ofsted, citing evidence that secondary school pupils are dropping arts subjects before reaching their GCSE years.¹²⁵

65. Particular concerns have been expressed about music teaching. As we noted in our Live Music report,¹²⁶ a recent survey by the University of Sussex found that 59% of nearly 500 schools in England which responded thought the EBacc has had a negative impact on the provision of music, compared to 2.5% who considered it as having a positive impact.¹²⁷ The review also showed that an increasing number of schools have reduced or removed music in the curriculum in Year 7 and, worryingly, by 2018/19 it was compulsory in fewer than 50% of schools at Year 9, against 84% responding to a previous study covering 2012/13.

66. Furthermore, the numbers of music teachers had also fallen year on year, with the average numbers of music staff in independent schools much higher than in state schools. Of the responding schools, 18% offered no GCSE music option at all and the decline is set to continue. Those offering music at ‘A’ level also fell by 15.4% between 2016 and 2018, with further falls expected, and numbers offering ‘A’ level Music Technology declined by 31.7%.

67. “The EBacc was frequently cited as a reason for a shift in curriculum focus, which negatively impacted staffing,” the authors Dr Ally Daubney and Duncan Mackrill of the University of Sussex noted. “Evidence from the data shows that the EBacc has a detrimental impact on whether students are able to opt for Music where it is offered. In some schools top set students were guided away from taking Music at KS4 because of the EBacc, whilst in others lower ability students were prevented from taking Music so they could concentrate on EBacc subjects.”¹²⁸

119 Q292

120 Department for Education [English Baccalaureate policy paper](#) December 2018

121 Oral evidence taken on 30 October 2018 [HC 733](#)

122 Including from Society of Authors [\[SCS0240\]](#) para 5.4, CAMEo [\[SCS0076\]](#) para 8, Music Education Council [\[SCS0080\]](#) para 9, Institute of Conservation [\[SCS0097\]](#) para 4.1.2, Siobhan Davies Dance [\[SCS0103\]](#) para 1.2, Equity [\[SCS0184\]](#) and National Theatre [\[SCS0164\]](#) para 3.1.2, Incorporated Society of Musicians [\[SCS0253\]](#) para 13 and Q266 [Naveed Idrees]

123 Ofqual [Entries for GCSE, AS and A level: summer 2018 exam series](#) May 2018

124 Cultural Learning Alliance [\[SCS0171\]](#) para 37

125 [Letter from Amanda Spielman to Chair of Public Accounts Committee 30 October 2018](#) [accessed on 30 April 2019]

126 Digital, Culture, Media and Sport Committee Ninth Report of session 2017–19 [Live Music](#) HC 733

127 Dr Ally Daubney and Duncan Mackrill [Changes in Secondary Music Curriculum Provision over time 2016–18/19 Summary of the research](#) October 2018

128 *Ibid*

68. But the Minister for School Standards, Rt Hon Nick Gibb MP, told us that the take-up of arts GCSEs has remained “broadly stable” at around 44% of pupils, and said “we take music and the arts extremely seriously”.¹²⁹ The Government’s ambition is to see 75% of pupils studying the EBacc subject combination at GCSE by 2022, and 90% by 2025.¹³⁰ Mr Gibb told us that his personal ambition is to secure a rise in the number of pupils taking music at GCSE.¹³¹

69. Since the minister gave evidence, however, a fresh report from the All-Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education, chaired by Diana Johnson MP and Andrew Percy MP, has challenged the Government’s position that music teaching has remained ‘broadly stable’.¹³² By the Department for Education’s own statistics, students taking music at GCSE have fallen by nearly 17% since 2014/15 and the time allocated to music teaching in Years 7–9 in state secondary schools has dropped by 26.7% since 2010. “This reflects the encroachment of the EBacc into Key Stage 3,” the report concludes.

70. More broadly across the arts sector, the National Theatre emphasised the role that schools should play in developing “skilled and qualified creative talent for our sector—whether those children go on to become actors, designers, computer programmers, stage engineers, accountants, or producers”.¹³³ The Crafts Council suggested that there is a mismatch between the subjects that are valued in the education system and the economic importance of the creative industries,¹³⁴ and Helen O’Donnell told us that the current curriculum may be narrowing the horizons of young people.¹³⁵ While many arts organisations explicitly focus on reaching a range of people, the University of the Arts London pointed out that the Government cannot simply rely on cultural institutions to promote diversity and must play its part by ensuring that creative education is available to everyone.¹³⁶ Concerns were also raised about a potentially widening gap in arts provision between state and private schools.¹³⁷

Measuring cultural education

71. Ofsted inspectors are required to take account of pupils’ cultural development, understanding and skills, attained through both the curriculum and extra-curricular opportunities.¹³⁸ But Naveed Idrees told us that the current education inspection framework is too narrow and risks treating children as “just numbers in a statistical game”:¹³⁹

The system, the regulatory framework, measures only two subjects in the primary curriculum. There are 11 subjects in the primary curriculum and we only measure two. That sends the wrong message out to schools, to

129 Q285

130 Department for Education [English Baccalaureate policy paper](#) December 2018

131 Q278

132 All-Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education, the Incorporated Society of Musicians and the University of Sussex [Music Education: state of the nation](#) January 2019

133 National Theatre [[SCS0164](#)] para 2.2

134 Crafts Council [[SCS0034](#)] para 4.1

135 Q261

136 University of the Arts London [[SCS0217](#)] para 15

137 Action for Children’s Arts [[SCS0037](#)], Q42, UK Music [[SCS0165](#)] para 11, Incorporated Society of Musicians [[SCS0253](#)] para 8

138 Department for Culture, Media and Sport [The Culture White Paper](#) March 2016

139 Q230

leaders, and that means what is important is what is measured. There are others subjects that are important. They are not measured in SATs but they are absolutely important.¹⁴⁰

72. Amongst others, the Royal Shakespeare Company suggested that “a high quality culture offer” should be a required element in securing an outstanding Ofsted rating.¹⁴¹ Education Minister Nick Gibb MP told us that Ofsted’s focus is not on individual subjects but on offering a “broad and balanced curriculum” and that the inspection framework is due to be revised and “strengthened” during 2019.¹⁴² However, it is clear that the transformative potential of music and arts education, both to schools and individual students, is not recognised by the current inspection system.

Funding cultural education

73. The Pupil Premium has been operating in England since 2011, allocating additional funds to schools based on the number of pupils who are eligible for free school meals. In 2017/18 £2.4 billion was allocated through the scheme.¹⁴³ This money has been an important way for cultural organisations to target the interventions they are offering to reach the most disadvantaged children.¹⁴⁴ But Helen O’Donnell told us that she does not believe that pupil premium funding is reaching the children who need it most,¹⁴⁵ and that it may be higher-performing schools who are more willing to invest resources in additional arts and sports activities.¹⁴⁶ Cultural alliance ‘What Next? Newcastle Gateshead’ suggested that there should be a dedicated premium payment for arts,¹⁴⁷ but Mr Idrees pointed out that while funding is necessary, the most important element is ensuring that schools have the leadership and infrastructure to make the arts a core part of what they do.¹⁴⁸

74. We are deeply concerned by the evidence we received around the downgrading of arts subjects in schools, with all the consequent implications for children’s development, wellbeing, experiences, careers and, ultimately, life chances. It is not enough for the DCMS and DfE to simply expect schools to provide a ‘broad and balanced curriculum’: they need to take action to ensure that this is actually happening. The Government has not shied away from a prescriptive approach to other facets of education policy, for example specifying which times tables primary school children need to learn.

75. There is also evidence from Wales that, with pressure on schools budgets, it is not just in England that down grading of arts subjects in schools has occurred and long established support for music services has declined in recent years.¹⁴⁹

140 Q228

141 Royal Shakespeare Company [[SCS0123](#)] para 7.3, see also Engage [[SCS0156](#)], What Next? Newcastle Gateshead [[SCS0092](#)] para 16 and Incorporated Society of Musicians [[SCS0253](#)] para 14, Q238

142 Q306

143 [The Pupil Premium](#) Briefing Paper 6700, House of Commons Library, April 2018

144 See for example Children and the Arts [[SCS0130](#)] and Science Museum Group [[SCS0157](#)] para 3.3.1

145 Q243

146 Q244

147 What Next? Newcastle Gateshead [[SCS0092](#)] para 17

148 Q250

149 The Leader [Fears Wrexham could lose its musical voice due to budget cuts](#) 23 February 2018

76. This is the area in our broad-ranging inquiry where there was the largest gap between government’s policy intentions and statements and the lived experience of organisations submitting evidence. This gap urgently needs to be closed, including through a clear explanation from the DfE and the DCMS of the figures on cultural education that they hold, and why these seem to differ from those used by cultural organisations concerned about arts education. The DfE should also set out how schools can find out about inspirational approaches such as that taken by Feversham Primary Academy.

77. The Education Minister told us that Ofsted will be ‘strengthening’ its inspection regime during 2019. *The DfE and DCMS should work alongside Ofsted to design an inspection regime for primary and secondary schools that measures the volume of cultural education; the integration of cultural education with other areas of the curriculum; and the universality of schools’ cultural offers in ensuring that all children have access to the benefits that cultural participation can bring. The DfE should make sure that case studies sharing the experiences and results of schools like Feversham are readily available for other headteachers and leaders in education.*

78. The Minister for School Standards told us he wanted to see an increase in the number of pupils taking arts subjects at GCSE and A Level. *The best way to ensure that this happens is to add these subjects to the EBacc, as recommended in our recent Live Music Inquiry and by our predecessor committee in 2013 in its Supporting the Creative Economy inquiry.*

79. We reiterate the conclusions from our Live Music Report in respect of music education, in schools and through Music Hubs, and look forward to the Government’s response.¹⁵⁰ We remain deeply concerned about the gap between the Government’s reassuring rhetoric and the evidence presented to us of the decline in music provision in state schools, for which the Ebacc is blamed and which affects students from less advantaged socio-economic backgrounds disproportionately. We commend, therefore, the work of the All Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education in pursuing these issues further and would welcome sight of the Government’s response to each of the 18 recommendations in its recent report ‘Music Education: State of the Nation’.

Sport and education

80. The *Sporting Future* strategy notes that positive early experiences of sport can lead to “a lifetime of participation” while a negative experience may “put someone off forever”.¹⁵¹ The evidence that we received confirmed that sport can play a transformative role in the lives of children and young people. Education Minister Nick Gibb MP told us “I think children being active is hugely important not just for their academic achievement but also for their long-term health and mental wellbeing as well”,¹⁵² while Alistair Campbell commented that physical activity for children “has benefits beyond the fact that it is good fun”.¹⁵³ Football 4 Peace noted “the children, some as young as six years of age, we have encountered already know some of the hegemonic core values of sport—that of

150 Digital, Culture, Media and Sport Committee Ninth Report of session 2017–19 [Live Music](#) HC 733, conclusions 16, 17, 18 and 19

151 HM Government [Sporting Future: a new strategy for an active nation](#) December 2015

152 Q299

153 Q189

competition and winning. This is true in British schools as it is on the grassy pitches in Israel, as on the sandy fields of Gambian villages. The use of sport for educational purposes is nothing new.”¹⁵⁴

81. Much of the evidence we heard about is focused within schools¹⁵⁵ but sport can also support children and young people who may be less likely to thrive within the formal education system,¹⁵⁶ or complement classroom learning.¹⁵⁷ John Herriman told us about the need to better capture the holistic contribution that sport can make:

You talk about physical education in schools and people have this very traditional perception of what it is, which is running around the sports field. I think the general sense within education is they have to change the perception of sport so it is about the whole child.¹⁵⁸

82. Our inquiry builds on an existing evidence base demonstrating a link between sporting participation and educational attainment.¹⁵⁹ An evaluation of Greenhouse Sport’s work within schools found that pupils who take part in its programmes academically outperform their peers by up to one-third of a grade in English and 40% of a grade in Maths.¹⁶⁰ GCSE performance for schools who had been Youth Sport Trust members between 2011/12 and 2014/15 was 7% better than for schools who had never been Youth Sport Trust members.¹⁶¹ The number of young people performing at a ‘good’ or ‘excellent’ level at school increased from 70% to 87% after three years on the Sporteducate programme.¹⁶²

83. The education system has a key role to play in ensuring all children and young people are able to participate in sport.¹⁶³ The Youth Sport Trust see a clear link between their work and socio-economic background: schools with the highest proportion of pupils on Free School Meals have the highest level of engagement with the organisation.¹⁶⁴ During an evidence session on the future of Wembley Stadium, former England footballer Gary Neville said schools are “the only real true place where you can say that everybody has free and real access [to sport], otherwise you have to pay for it”.¹⁶⁵

84. Youth charity Street League run a ‘sport-for-employment’ programme that aims to help young people from disadvantaged communities into employment. Sport is used to teach softer skills such as teamwork and communications, alongside an employability curriculum. In 2017, Street League supported 1,766 young people into employment, education and training. More than 300 young people achieved qualifications at Levels 1

154 [SCS0106](#) para 6

155 For example, England and Wales Cricket Board fund the Chance to Shine Programme [\[SCS0107\]](#), the Premier League run the Primary Stars programme [\[SCS0134\]](#) para 31-para 35, the British Horseracing Authority run the Racing to school programme [\[SCS0149\]](#) para 2.6 and the Countryside Alliance Foundation run the Falconry for Schools programme [\[SCS0088\]](#) para 30 to para 37

156 For example, the Tennis Foundation run the Beyond the Baseline programme supporting young people struggling with either their behaviour or academic performance in school, through tennis and tennis mentors [\[SCS0226\]](#) para 4.3, see also British Horse Society [\[SCS0243\]](#) para s 4.1 to 4.3

157 For example Children’s University supplementary evidence [\[SCS0254\]](#) paras 3a to 3e

158 Q51

159 [Sport, Recreation and the Arts Debate on 19 December 2018](#) House of Lords Library December 2018

160 Greenhouse Sports [\[SCS0163\]](#) para 4.3

161 Youth Sport Trust [\[SCS0047\]](#) para 13

162 Sported Foundation [\[SCS0072\]](#) para 3.1

163 For example, the EFL Trust works with schools in deprived areas to teach children about healthy eating and making sport fun, as this is something they may not encounter in their home life [\[SCS0102\]](#) para 2.2

164 Youth Sport Trust [\[SCS0047\]](#) para 5

165 Oral evidence taken before the Digital, Culture, Media and Sport Committee 18 July 2018 [HC 1026](#) Q8

and 2. A 2017 participant commented, “Street League has helped me to meet new people, build positive relationships and most importantly enabled me to experience new things. I am now in a positive, happy place because I am employed full time, without the support and guidance from Street League I wouldn’t have been able to achieve this goal”.¹⁶⁶

Sport in the school curriculum

85. PE is a compulsory subject at all stages in the curriculum, although there is no prescribed target for how much school time should be spent on it.¹⁶⁷ We found concerns about the relative place of sports within the current national curriculum, and the consequent impact on numbers of specialist PE teachers.¹⁶⁸ New College Leicester noted: “even though swimming unaided for 25 metres by the end of Key Stage 2 is part of the national curriculum an enormous amount of young people leave Primary School not being able to swim”,¹⁶⁹ and Swim England told us that “the current political landscape” has prevented further action on increasing swimming levels amongst children.¹⁷⁰ Research suggests that over one-third of secondary schools have cut curriculum time for core PE since 2012.¹⁷¹ Government figures indicate that in a typical week in November 2017, 282,200 hours of physical education was taught, compared to 333,800 hours in November 2010.¹⁷² However, Education Minister Nick Gibb MP defended the Government’s record on PE, saying that sport has the third highest curriculum time spent on it in primary schools and the fourth highest in secondary schools.¹⁷³

86. There was concern about fragmentation between different Whitehall departments over funding and scrutiny of school sport.¹⁷⁴ John Herriman noted that DCMS has been stepping up activity on school sport with an enhanced role for Sport England, at the same time that sport “is dropping off the agenda to a degree within Education rather than increasing”.¹⁷⁵ Charity consultancy Pro Bono Economics noted that the split between school and out of school sport is detrimental to evaluating progress on getting children more active.¹⁷⁶ The DCMS told us that sport, education and health ministers sit on the Ministerial School Sport Board which provides a cross-government forum to discuss issues related to PE and school sport.¹⁷⁷

87. While we have been carrying out our inquiry, the Education Secretary has announced his intention to create a new school sport and activity action plan, working with DCMS and the Department of Health and Social Care.¹⁷⁸ In their evidence, the Sport and School Standards Ministers confirmed that the forthcoming plan will play a key role in ensuring all children meet recommended activity levels.¹⁷⁹ Although the ministers were keen to tell us about their joint working on this issue, Sports and Civil Society Minister Mims

166 Street League [SCS0066]

167 Sport, Recreation and the Arts Debate on 19 December 2018 House of Lords Library December 2018

168 Lawn Tennis Association and Tennis Foundation [SCS0226] para 6.4

169 New College Leicester [SCS0029] para 1.3, see also What next? Newcastle Gateshead [SCS0092] para 4

170 Swim England [SCS0199] para 25

171 Youth Sport Trust [SCS0047] para 16

172 Same ref as 79

173 Q293

174 New College Leicester [SCS0029] and Sport and Recreation Alliance [SCS0147] para 3.3

175 Q12

176 Pro Bono Economic [SCS0241] para 7

177 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [SCS0202]

178 Department for Education [New education and skills measures announced](#) October 2018

179 Q299, Q309

Davies MP also told us that she is only responsible for out of school sport. She said “my part of the day is between 4.00pm and 6.00pm and the weekend”, indicating limits to her involvement and remit in a school sport action plan.¹⁸⁰

88. Sport England have recently published their first set of figures on children’s participation in sport and physical activity, both in and out of school.¹⁸¹ The figures show that just 17.5% of children and young people are meeting the current Chief Medical Officer’s guidelines of taking part in sport and physical activity for at least 60 minutes every day. A further 25.7% of children and young people are active for more than 60 minutes a day on average, but not every day. The Government has a national ambition to halve childhood obesity and significantly reduce the gap in obesity between children from the most and least deprived areas by 2030.¹⁸²

89. There was broad agreement that children need to be engaged in physical activity early in order to improve these figures and help tackle childhood obesity.¹⁸³ But John Herriman expressed concern that interventions in schools are short term and contracted out.¹⁸⁴ The school standards minister told about the importance of the Daily Mile¹⁸⁵ in driving up participation, suggesting that this should be championed by all primary schools,¹⁸⁶ but was unable to point to any evidence that this would be the most effective intervention to increase physical activity levels amongst schoolchildren. Subsequently, Sport England have invested £1.5 million in the scheme with the target of ensuring that 20,000 schools sign up to the Daily Mile initiative.¹⁸⁷

Primary PE and Sport Premium

90. The Government introduced the Primary PE and Sport Premium in 2013 to improve the provision of physical education and school sport in primary schools across England. In the current financial year, schools with 16 or fewer eligible pupils receive £1,000 per pupil and schools with 17 or more eligible pupils receive £16,000 and an additional payment of £10 per pupil.¹⁸⁸ Total investment is £320 million for 2018/19, including funding from the Soft Drinks Industry Levy.¹⁸⁹ The Government has stated that the funding will continue to be provided up to 2020.¹⁹⁰

91. Sport and PE Premium money is allocated directly by the government to academies and free schools, and by the local authority to maintained schools. Schools are required to publish details of how they spent this funding and the impact it had on pupils’ PE and sport participation and attainment. But we found that there is limited oversight of how the money is being used,¹⁹¹ despite the fact that this is an area Ofsted examines in its

180 Q303

181 Sport England [Active Lives Children and Young People Survey 2017/18](#) December 2018

182 Department of Health and Social Care [Childhood obesity: a plan for action, chapter 2](#) June 2018

183 Q15 [John Herriman], Q216 [Dr Daisy Fancourt, Q303 [Mims Davies MP]

184 Q17

185 The Daily Mile is a programme of activity that encourages children to walk, jog or run at their own pace for 15 minutes every day in their primary or nursery schools. London Sport [\[SCS0222\]](#) para 21

186 Q300, Q301

187 Sport England [Funding to help children get active](#) 17 December 2018

188 Department for Education [PE and sport premium: funding allocations for 2017 to 2018](#) October 2017

189 The levy was introduced in 2016. Manufacturers are required to pay 24 pence per litre of drink if it contains 8 grams of sugar per 100 millilitres and 18p per litre of drink if it contains between 5 – 8 grams of sugar per 100 millilitres. All money raised through the levy is reinvested by the Government in tackling childhood obesity.

190 [Physical education and sport in schools](#) Briefing Paper 6836, House of Commons Library, October 2018

191 New College Leicester [\[SCS0029\]](#) para 1.3, Sport and Recreation Alliance [\[SCS0147\]](#) para 3.3 and Q17

inspection of schools.¹⁹² A 2014 Ofsted review found that while schools benefitting from the Premium have strengthened their provision, many headteachers felt that the absence of clear guidance “meant that they did not initially feel confident or well prepared to use it effectively.”¹⁹³ Debbie Lye from Spirit of 2012 said:

I think you have to develop a specification of that evaluation, so what does “good” look like in, say, the sport premium? That is not necessarily just education outcomes, because they might come later down the line, but I think there has to be some sort of indication without having a rigid, prescriptive framework, for saying what is good practice and what is not. I did hear of a school that spent all their sport premium on a one-off experience of everybody going horse riding, which is great but what is going to happen for the rest of the year and what is the ongoing health and fitness and so on benefits?¹⁹⁴

92. Whilst high rates of childhood obesity, coupled with low levels of physical activity, are rightly the policy driver for sport in education, it is important for the DCMS to champion the wider benefits including tackling social exclusion, supporting employability and increasing educational attainment.

93. While we welcome the forthcoming school sport and activity action plan, the Government must ensure that this does not simply perpetuate existing fragmentation between school and out of school sport. The DCMS and DfE should also ensure the plan emphasises the wider benefits of sport to children and young people, and highlights best practice evidence.

94. The Government should commit to extend funding for the Primary PE and Sport Premium beyond 2020. The DCMS and DfE should work with Ofsted to ensure that their new inspection framework assesses how this money is used to further the widest social impact that sport can have on children, as well as contributing to tackling childhood obesity.

192 Ofsted [School inspection handbook](#) July 2018

193 Ofsted [The PE and sport premium for primary schools – good practice to maximise effective use of the funding](#) October 2014

194 Q267

3 Improving health and wellbeing

95. Health was a dominant theme in the evidence that we received to our inquiry, with many organisations contacting us with us examples of the benefits to mental and physical health as a result of participation in cultural and sporting activities. We explored the extent to which cultural and sporting organisations are having a beneficial impact on physical and psychological wellbeing, and whether these interventions could help the UK tackle the demographic health challenges it is currently facing.

96. In the time that we have been undertaking our inquiry, Health Secretary Rt Hon Matt Hancock MP has described the arts as essential to health and wellbeing.¹⁹⁵ This builds on the impetus within the cultural sector in recent years to quantify the impact of the arts on health,¹⁹⁶ notably through the Cultural Value project¹⁹⁷ and work of the All-Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing.¹⁹⁸ This work was highlighted by several submissions, indicating its potential to inform future policy. The All-Party Group found that the positive impact of the arts on health is strongest in tackling psychosis in young adults, postnatal depression, recovery from neurological damage and falls prevention in older people.¹⁹⁹ In their evidence to our inquiry, cultural organisations described the positive impact they are having across the whole health spectrum, from prevention to supporting people recovering from ill health to helping people living with long term conditions.²⁰⁰

97. Wight Harmony²⁰¹ is a male barbershop choir on the Isle of Wight. One participant commented: “I have found that my recovery from bowel cancer has been enhanced by my association with barbershop singing. My relationship with fellow singers is in no small way responsible for my recovery. It is quite diverse from any hobby or pastime that I have been involved in the past, but having said that, it’s one of the best moves that I have made in my life. Learning to enunciate and sing correctly has been a source of great inspiration and education for me.”

98. Sports and Civil Society Minister Mims Davies MP told us that the DCMS will “advocate for the role of arts and culture” in meeting the aims of the NHS.²⁰² Over the last three years, Arts Council England has invested more than £23 million in organisations working towards health and wellbeing outcomes.²⁰³ Analysis of data on arts participation rates in England estimates that the total annual NHS cost savings due to reductions in GP visits is £168.8 million.²⁰⁴ Susannah Hall, Head of Arts at Great Ormond Street Hospital for Children, told us that while arts in hospitals are “funded in all sorts of ways”²⁰⁵ her team is funded through the hospital’s charity rather than directly from the NHS.

195 Matt Hancock, [The power of the arts and social activities to improve the nation's health](#) 6 November 2018

196 For example, Professor Helen Chatterjee [[SCS0201](#)], BOP consulting [[SCS0193](#)], HC Deb, 11 October 2017 col143WH

197 Geoffrey Crossick and Patrycja Kaszynska [Understanding the value of arts and culture: the AHRC cultural value project](#) March 2016

198 During 2015–17 the All Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing conducted an inquiry into the benefits that the arts can bring to health and wellbeing.

199 All-Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing [[SCS0078](#)] para 9

200 For example, LIME Music for Health [[SCS0042](#)], Great Ormond Street Hospital for Children NHS Trust [[SCS0010](#)], Age UK [[SCS0045](#)], Nottingham Contemporary [[SCS0048](#)]

201 Wight Harmony [[SCS0028](#)]

202 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [[SCS0259](#)]

203 Arts Council England [[SCS0235](#)] para 1.4

204 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [[SCS0202](#)]

205 Q192

99. Dance to Health²⁰⁶ is a nationwide community dance programme for older people that combines evidence-based physiotherapy with the creativity, expression and energy of dance. The programme is running in six areas of England and seeking to reduce falls amongst older people. Dance to Health has been oversubscribed and has been found to reduce GP visits by 50%. Run by arts charity Aesop the programme offers an effective, financially sustainable model which could grow to benefit many older people across the UK at the same time as reducing NHS spending.

100. In our inquiry we found that the link between arts and health has the richest evidence base. Dr Daisy Fancourt from University College London told us:

We have fantastic case studies, [of the positive impact on arts on health] but we also have incredibly rigorous research that shows the benefits of this. This is not something that is just based on anecdote anymore. We are seeing huge buy-in from multiple different sectors. Personally, I have worked with over 100 NHS trusts in the last few years, had thousands of patients involved in studies, and got hundreds of major national arts and cultural organisations involved in this. We are also seeing big interest outside the UK.²⁰⁷

101. However, Dr Fancourt noted that the evidence base has developed largely at a grassroots level. Many organisations that submitted evidence to our inquiry used self-reported wellbeing, captured as part of specific programme evaluations, to demonstrate the value of cultural participation.²⁰⁸ There have also been attempts to create a common methodology to quantify health impact for the whole cultural sector²⁰⁹ and to ensure that data on the value of arts is presented in a way that makes the case to health commissioners.²¹⁰ This gap between grassroots evidence and health commissioning is an obvious area where the Government could provide greater support.

Social prescribing

102. Social prescribing is a scheme that enables GPs and other frontline healthcare professionals to refer people to activities in their community instead of only offering medication.²¹¹ It is currently used by around 60% of local health commissioners.²¹² Our evidence suggests that social prescribing is playing an increasingly important role in connecting health and the arts but that the potential of the scheme is yet to be realised.²¹³ Arts on Prescription courses in Cambridgeshire and Peterborough led to a 73% decrease in reported depression,²¹⁴ the Artlift scheme in Gloucestershire delivered a cost saving of £471 per patient,²¹⁵ and 68% of participants in the Reading Well Books on Prescription scheme said their symptoms improved as a result.²¹⁶ Alastair Campbell, mental health campaigner, said:

206 Case study supplied by All-Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing [SCS0078] para 12 and Nesta [SCS0110] para 1.7 and 1.8, further information taken from www.dancetohealth.org

207 Q181

208 For example, National Youth Theatre of Great Britain [SCS0114], Bristol Culture [SCS0069] para 3, and Streetwise Opera [SCS100] para 14–15

209 For example Aesop Arts and Society Limited [SCS0002] para 2.6

210 Q55 [Darren Henley]

211 Kings Fund [What is social prescribing?](#) February 2017

212 Department of Health and Social Care [SCS0256]

213 Q58 [Darren Henley], Q188 [Dr Fancourt], Q200, Age UK [SCS0045] para 12–13

214 All-Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing [SCS0078] para 14

215 Arts Council England [SCS0235] para 3.15

216 BOP Consulting [SCS0193] para 17–18

I do not think we are even at the beginning of discovering the opportunities in peer-to-peer groups, social prescribing and that kind of thing, which can help deliver better services for people who need them.²¹⁷

103. Susannah Hall suggested that social prescribing could be a mechanism to move funding for arts health interventions out of discretionary or charitable funding into core health service budgets.²¹⁸ Our inquiry heard that one model of social prescribing uses link workers²¹⁹ who are abreast of what is available in their area, and who support GPs to make referrals,²²⁰ and that there are intermediaries who can specifically match arts organisations to health commissioners.²²¹ Mr Campbell told us that social prescribing could be particularly beneficial to people living with mental illness, and that this would be more cost effective than medication.²²² The Department of Health told us that more evidence is needed on cost effectiveness, and so NHS England will be publishing a standardised model and outcomes framework for social prescribing, allowing more data to be collected.²²³ In the summer of 2018, while we were undertaking our inquiry, the Department of Health and Social Care announced additional investment in 23 social prescribing schemes.²²⁴

104. Several organisations described the power of the arts to both help delay the onset of dementia and improve quality of life for people living with dementia.²²⁵ For example, charity Rhythmix and Bournemouth Symphony Orchestra deliver live music sessions in dementia wards and units.²²⁶ Historic Royal Palaces have developed the Sensory Palaces programme, delivering dedicated sessions at their sites for people living with dementia and their carers. One participant commented, “there were a lot of things that I knew, there were things that I didn’t know and there were things I’d forgotten! So, all in all, it gave me an enthusiasm”.²²⁷

105. National Museums Liverpool’s House of Memories training programme has reached 12,000 dementia carers and delivered over £12 million of social value.²²⁸ Sefton Library Service record the life stories of people with the beginning of memory loss, providing a reminiscence tool for the patient and supporting the local history archive.²²⁹ Participatory arts charity Spare Tyre²³⁰ has worked with more than 4,000 people with dementia

217 Q179

218 Q195

219 [NHS England](#) describes the role of link workers as offering ‘people time, focusing on ‘what matters to me’ and taking a holistic approach to people’s health and wellbeing. They connect people to community groups and statutory services for practical and emotional support. Link workers also support existing community groups to be accessible and sustainable, and help people to start new groups, working collaboratively with all local partners.’

220 Q205, Department of Health and Social Care [\[SCS0256\]](#)

221 Q206

222 Q199

223 Department of Health and Social Care [\[SCS0256\]](#)

224 Department of Health and Social Care [Social prescribing schemes across England to receive £4.5 million](#) 23 July 2018 [accessed on 15 January 2019]

225 Q222–225, Dr Daisy Fancourt [\[SCS0248\]](#), further case studies were also provided by the Baring Foundation [\[SCS0023\]](#)

226 Rhythmix (wishing well) [\[SCS0060\]](#) para 15–22, Arts and Health South West [\[SCS0174\]](#) para 5, Association of British Orchestras [\[SCS0112\]](#) para 5.6

227 Historic Royal Palaces supplementary evidence [\[SCS0056\]](#)

228 National Museums Liverpool [\[SCS0073\]](#) para 4.1.1–4.1.8, National Museum Directors Council and the Museums Association [\[SCS0131\]](#) para 8

229 Chartered Institute of Library & Information Professionals [\[SCS0040\]](#) para 11

230 Spare Tyre Theatre Company [\[SCS0067\]](#) para 11–20

nationally in care homes, day centres, community centres and cultural venues. A manager in one of the care homes involved said “this work has the ability to change the culture of how we work with older people with dementia [...] a really amazing level of interaction was achieved.” The Department of Health and Social Care told us that arts interventions “do not slow down the progression of dementia, but they are playing an increasing role in helping people to cope with the emotional and cognitive effects”.²³¹

106. The full health impacts of cultural programmes are far from being reached. The DCMS should take the opportunity of the expansion of social prescribing to work with the Department of Health and Social Care to test how far prescription of arts and sports interventions can be mainstreamed in the 23 areas; to develop closer links between commissioning decisions and arts and sports programmes and organisations; and to assess how self-reported wellbeing can be better integrated into health commissioning processes. At present, there appears to be little collection of evidence by Government of the cumulative benefit of cultural programmes, despite the enthusiasm of the organisations who have seen huge benefits.

107. The DCMS and DHSC should ensure that NHS England’s forthcoming outcomes framework and guidance on social prescribing includes information about the power of arts and sporting interventions to improve both physical and mental health, and work to extend the availability of cultural benefits to more people affected by such conditions. The DCMS should track the evidence base on cost effectiveness that develops as a result of the use of this guidance.

Sport and health

108. There is a well-established link between physical activity and health, in terms of physical fitness, and consequent reduction in risk factors for many long-term diseases.²³² Physical inactivity is estimated to cost the NHS £1 billion a year, with wider social costs totalling £7.4 billion a year.²³³ There is also a link between physical activity and wellbeing. Alastair Campbell described the mental health benefits of participation in straightforward terms:

One of the worst things about depression is the feeling that you do not want to go and do anything. You do not have the energy or the desire to go and take exercise, but you might if it was in your diary every Tuesday and every Friday: this is what you are going to do and these are the people you are going to go with, and you know you can talk to them and so forth.²³⁴

109. Much of the evidence that we received was from sports clubs working in their communities to increase participation and deliver consequent health benefits. While there is no standard method for evaluation,²³⁵ sporting organisations measured their impact on both physical health and mental wellbeing. Many organisations placed at least as much of a premium on mental wellbeing as on physical health. For example, walking charity Living Streets reported that 80% of participants on their programme for older people felt

231 Department of Health and Social Care [[SCS0256](#)]

232 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [[SCS0202](#)]

233 NICE guideline [Physical activity and the environment](#) March 2018

234 Q199

235 Q24

less stressed or anxious and 76% felt fitter or healthier as a result²³⁶, while parkrun told us 95% of people doing free timed runs in their local park said that they felt both healthier and happier and 97% said they felt more positive as a result.²³⁷ Crawley Town Community Foundation used football coaching and other activities to support people experiencing or at risk of experiencing mental health problems, with 78% of participants strongly agreeing that the project had given them a positive activity to focus on.²³⁸

110. Dementia was a particular mental health focus for some of the sporting organisations that submitted evidence to our inquiry. Swim England ran a three-year project with 48 leisure centres which has led to over 1,250 people with dementia having improved mood, higher cognitive and physical ability, and reduced anxiety as a result of taking part.²³⁹ Many county cricket grounds are running designated ‘dementia days’ to give people with dementia an opportunity to reconnect with cricket.²⁴⁰

111. One participant in Let’s Get Moving, a 12-week structured physical activity programme commented “When I started Let’s Get Moving, I suffered with depression—to a point where I would find it a struggle to get off the sofa to do everyday things. Being more active has really helped with that—I feel so much more motivated to do more and get on with everything. Each day I feel more and more motivated to do things—even things that I’d never normally do, such as walking for that bit longer or actively taking the kids outside to just do something. I’ve been feeling so much better in myself that I’ve started to cut down on my antidepressants! The extra bits of activity that I’ve been doing has also meant that I’m losing weight, which is really good”.²⁴¹

112. It’s clear that sporting organisations are also working to ensure that all groups can benefit from sporting participation. Charlton Athletic run a football skills programme for children and adults with Down’s Syndrome,²⁴² DanceSyndrome runs community dance workshops and dance leadership training for people with learning disabilities,²⁴³ the England and Wales Cricket Board estimate that in the last three years over twenty two thousand people have taken part in community or club disability cricket,²⁴⁴ and 41 percent of participants in the Premier League Kicks programme were young people from a minority ethnic background.²⁴⁵

113. Walking football is aimed at people over 50 who cannot play traditional football for mobility or other reasons. Many of the football organisations who submitted evidence to our inquiry run such initiatives, reporting benefits including weight loss, improved fitness and improved mental health for participants.²⁴⁶ During our visit to Manchester City Football Club, we saw first-hand how walking football had provided a route back to sporting participation for older men who had previously enjoyed playing regular football, with participants telling us about how the sessions have helped to reduce social isolation. This was also reflected in the written evidence that we received. Derek, who plays walking

236 Living Streets [SCS0021] para 21

237 parkrun [SCS0242] para 9

238 Crawley Town Community Foundation [SCS0118]

239 Swim England [SCS0199] para 14

240 England and Wales Cricket Board [SCS0107]

241 ukactive [SCS0128]

242 Charlton Athletic Community Trust [SCS0153]

243 DanceSyndrome [SCS104]

244 England and Wales Cricket Board [SCS0107]

245 Premier League [SCS0134] para 36

246 EFL Trust [SCS0102] para 2.2.4

football at Fleetwood Town Football Club commented, “I must state that on its own walking football is not a cure for my problems but it’s a big help. I still have to take what I call dizzy pills and loopy pills, making fun about anything and everything is now priority because that’s what walking football is all about.”²⁴⁷

Social prescribing

114. Similarly to the evidence that we heard about the impact of social prescribing on linking arts to health, we found that the scheme can deliver benefits through sport and physical activity. More than four out five people referred to East Riding of Yorkshire Council’s exercise on prescription scheme completed the programme, with 88 percent saying they felt healthier and 62 per cent saying they “felt better about themselves” as a result. Fusion Lifestyle reported savings to the public purse of £1.1 million from the exercise on referral schemes that they ran in 2014,²⁴⁸ and a physical activity referral scheme in Sheffield reported £3.42 worth of benefits generated for every £1 invested.²⁴⁹

115. Youth charity StreetGames run a range of programmes to take sport ‘to the doorstep’ of disadvantaged communities, including areas with high levels of inactivity. Their programmes include using sport to improve mental health, and working in schools to target inactive children. StreetGames have found that their sporting programmes have delivered a tangible impact on physical activity rates, subjective wellbeing and self-esteem of the disadvantaged young people who have taken part.²⁵⁰ The charity is playing a lead role in gathering best practice evidence of the impact that youth organisations can have on improving the health of young people, with a view to developing new guidelines for social prescribing link workers.²⁵¹

116. We also came across examples of prescribing being used to deliver social as well as physical health benefits. The Tennis Foundation takes referrals from GPs to not only help people be more physically active but also to increase their social interaction and social network.²⁵² This echoes recent recognition from the Government of the role that social prescribing that play in reducing loneliness.²⁵³

117. We reiterate our earlier recommendation about the importance of Government support for social prescribing. We also recommend that DCMS approach sporting organisations to encourage their participation in social prescribing schemes, which can go beyond physical health benefits to include social impacts such as tackling loneliness.

247 Fleetwood Town Community Trust [\[SCS0006\]](#)

248 Fusion Lifestyle [\[SCS0146\]](#)

249 The Sports and Recreation Trusts Association [\[SCS0148\]](#) para 8

250 Streetgames [\[SCS0064\]](#) para 1.14 and 1.19

251 Streetgames [\[SCS0064\]](#) para 1.22 and 1.23

252 Lawn Tennis Association and Tennis Foundation [\[SCS0226\]](#) para 3.2

253 HM Government [A connected society A strategy for tackling loneliness – laying the foundations for change](#) October 2018

4 Regenerating communities

118. The social impact of culture on communities, including the physical space that they inhabit, was central to many of the evidence submissions we received. Cultural organisations clearly see their impact on places as a key part of the value that they bring.²⁵⁴ Dr Beatriz Garcia from the Institute of Culture Capital commented that cultural-led regeneration “has become a very important motivation for a certain type of city that needed that renaissance” over the last thirty to forty years.²⁵⁵ Darren Henley, Chief Executive of Arts Council England, said:

My observation, having now met a lot of local authorities up and down the country, is that they are able to make choices. There are some leaderships in local authorities who see arts and culture as being absolutely central to how they are defining their places. For example, if you go to Plymouth and talk to the leader of the council there he will tell you that the future narrative there is all about arts and culture.²⁵⁶

119. Director of Sunderland City of Culture 2021 Rebecca Ball described how the leadership and investment from the local council has given confidence to national funders to also put investment into the city.²⁵⁷ Although it was ultimately unsuccessful, Rebecca Ball told us there was a huge benefit in Sunderland bidding to be the City of Culture 2021:

for us it was that ability to have a really public conversation about the role of culture within a place...it is within everybody’s interests to get involved in that conversation, because maybe there are people who do not necessarily believe they have an opinion on culture—I would challenge that; I think everybody does—but they certainly have an opinion about their city: they certainly have an opinion about where they live and where they work.²⁵⁸

The preparation of the bid involved “thousands of conversations”²⁵⁹ about the future of Sunderland with people across the city, enabling them to imagine the future of the place where they live.²⁶⁰

120. A legacy of the bidding process was the creation of Sunderland Culture, a new body which brings together the key partners in the city: the University of Sunderland, Sunderland City Council and the Music Arts and Culture Trust (MAC).²⁶¹ On our visit to Sunderland we saw the regeneration of the MAC Quarter first-hand. The area was formerly home to the city’s civic buildings and adjacent to the University campus and had fallen into disrepair. The renewed emphasis on cultural-led regeneration has helped to secure funding from the Heritage Lottery Fund, Arts Council England and the local council to develop a culture and leisure district, including transformation of the Old Fire Station which had been disused for 24 years. During 2018 the DCMS launched the £20 million Cultural Development Fund, investing in cultural initiatives and creative industries in towns and cities across England.²⁶²

254 The Cultural Spring [[SCS0081](#)], The Architectural Heritage Fund [[SCS016](#)]

255 Q166

256 Q29

257 Q164

258 Q151

259 Q152

260 Q163 [Rebecca Ball]

261 Q154

262 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [£20 million government boost for culture and creative industries in England](#) June 2018, Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [[SCS0259](#)]

Hull City of Culture 2017²⁶³

121. Hull City Council successfully bid to be City of Culture in 2017 as part of wider plans to increase the number of visitors to the city, and to drive up cultural participation amongst residents. There were more than 2,800 events during the year involving over 300 venues and public spaces. More than 9 out of 10 residents experienced at least one cultural activity during the year, and 60% of ticket-buying audiences were first time bookers. More than £32 million of funding was raised to deliver the year, from 80 funding partners, adding to Hull City Council's £3.6 million investment as Host City.

122. Rosie Millard OBE, former Chair of Hull City of Culture, told us:

I think that our year awakened a latent sense of pride in the city from the people who live there. That has to do with things that happened to them in the city in terms of the programme, because the programme was connected indelibly with the history of the city and delivered in an internationally high level of quality, so that people in the city saw their history being played out in a spectacular manner, beginning with the first event and carrying on all year [...] We made absolute efforts to go into every single postcode, every single ward, so the whole city was involved.²⁶⁴

123. Darren Henley agreed, saying “we have had some conversations in Hull in the last 12 months, and there are things that I never thought 25 years ago people would be doing and saying in Hull. It is a real change for the people who live there, and I think that is what is exciting—it is not just people like us from outside who are talking about it.”²⁶⁵ Spirit of 2012, who helped to fund the Year of Culture, told us that local pride had been transformed: “one volunteer perfectly encapsulated this change [saying] “People in Hull used to look at the ground—now they look at the sky.”²⁶⁶

124. Hull City of Culture suggested that the year was an exceptional opportunity to make the case for investment in culture to further health, wellbeing and community development agendas. They warned that making the case for investment in arts and culture cannot be “just left to the Arts Council, which should not be expected to be proxy agency for social equity and justice, when its role is to support great art.”²⁶⁷

Case study: coastal communities

125. The report of the House of Lords Select Committee on regenerating seaside towns and communities, published in April 2019, has also noted the importance of culture to the success of the regeneration of towns like Folkestone.²⁶⁸ Creative Folkestone, which was established by Sir Roger De Haan in 2003, has led the regeneration of the old town and harbour areas. This has included the purchase and renovation of properties which have been made available to creative businesses at discounted rents, the restoration of the harbour arm and station as a destination with bars, restaurants and places for artists

263 Hull UK City of Culture 2017 [[SCS0190](#)]

264 Q156

265 Q45

266 Spirit of 2012 [[SCS0036](#)] para 9

267 Hull UK City of Culture 2017 [[SCS0190](#)] para 45

268 House of Lords Select Committee on Regenerating Seaside Towns and Communities [The future of seaside towns](#) HL Paper 320

to perform, and the establishment of the Folkestone Triennial as a major international exhibition of contemporary sculpture and public art.²⁶⁹ There are now 530 creatives, from performance artists to dressmakers, dancers to graphic designers, living and working in Folkestone's Creative Quarter.²⁷⁰ According to figures from Creative Folkestone, the 2017 Triennial art exhibition, which featured 19 specially commissioned artworks, attracted 150,000 visitors to the town, generating £4 million in additional revenue.²⁷¹

126. We heard about the success stories that City of Culture initiatives can generate, including additional funding from the DCMS, Arts Council England and other sources. But these initiatives shouldn't just be limited to forward-thinking local authorities and communities.

127. The bidding process for UK City of Culture is creating real benefits for the communities that take part, and not just for the winning entries. *The Government should consider how towns and more rural communities can be incentivised to work together to develop strategies for culturally led regeneration.* We welcome the recent suggestion of a "Town of Culture" award to extend to towns the proven concept of a cultural benefit to communities of artistic activity.

128. *Local Enterprise Partnerships should be required to identify opportunities for cultural and creative industries led regeneration as part of their local growth strategies.*

129. *We recommend that DCMS commission organisations who have been in the vanguard of culture-based regeneration to produce detailed guidance and best practice for local authorities at city, town and borough levels on how they can leverage culture to revitalise their areas, irrespective of whether they have benefitted from specific funding to do so.*

Building legacies

130. Alongside examining the impact of major cultural initiatives such as the City of Culture competition, our inquiry looked at how major sporting events can revitalise areas. We saw the impact first-hand on our visit to Manchester City's Etihad Stadium, which has played a pivotal role in the regeneration of east Manchester following the 2002 Commonwealth Games. DCMS has suggested that the social outcomes from the *Sporting Future* strategy should form the basis of legacy planning from major sporting events.²⁷²

131. The Olympic Games were identified as a clear driver for participation in our evidence.²⁷³ Children's sports clubs set up in the wake of the London 2012 Olympic and Paralympic Games inspired over 41,000 children to increase their physical activity to reach recommended levels, and engaged over 7,000 inactive children in physical activity and sport.²⁷⁴ The National Trust used the 2016 Rio Olympics to create a 'Summer of Sport'

269 www.creativefolkestone.org.uk/

270 The Independent [Why Folkestone isn't the new Margate - it's even cooler](#) 2 April 2019

271 Kent Live [Folkestone Triennial bosses say how the exhibition brought a £4 million tourist boost to the town](#) 15 May 2018

272 DCMS and UK Sport [Gold Framework: Guidance on UK-level support available when bidding for and staging major sporting events](#) March 2018

273 The legacy from London 2012 has been reported on in four annual reports from 2013–2016. The government also commissioned an independent consortium led by Grant Thornton, to carry out a meta-evaluation of the impact of the games. Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [\[SCS0202\]](#)

274 Youth Sport Trust [\[SCS0047\]](#) para 9

campaign at their properties, with 40% of participants trying an activity for the first time.²⁷⁵ The Pandemonium Drummers were formed from a group of individual volunteers from around the UK who took part in the London 2012 Olympic Opening and Closing Ceremonies.²⁷⁶ The site of the 2012 Olympics will become a new cultural district involving institutions including the Victoria and Albert Museum, the Smithsonian, Sadler's Wells, UAL's London College of Fashion, and UCL.²⁷⁷

132. But we found scepticism about the extent to which the legacies from these major initiatives have really been maximised. Alastair Campbell commented that the government “missed a trick after the [2012] Olympics” as this could have been a turning point for using sport across the full range of policy areas.²⁷⁸ John Herriman told us there was a “pregnant pause” after the 2012 Games when investment in grassroots sport could have made a lasting change off the back of the inspiration that people felt.²⁷⁹ And Dr Garcia told us she is “especially interested in what happens 10 years on” from a City of Culture initiative. She commented “you will need the big opening ceremonies and some of the big acts, but some of the most transformative and memorable activities are at times that did not gather many headlines but really touched and transformed the lives of particular individuals.”²⁸⁰

133. Spirit of 2012 pointed to the exceptional nature of these initiatives, noting:

Mega events such as the Olympic & Paralympic Games have organising committees that fully integrate sports, cultural and volunteering strands into a cohesive whole. This holistic approach is not reflected in policy and government structures generally which makes it difficult for delivery organisations to collaborate and to navigate a ‘gated’ landscape in which sectors, funded and monitored separately from each other, are by nature disposed, as well as encouraged, to emphasise their distinctiveness rather than collaborating to recognise how much they have in common.²⁸¹

134. Ahead of Coventry’s City of Culture in 2021 and the Birmingham Commonwealth Games in 2022, the DCMS should set out detailed policy and funding structures for building a lasting legacy in the West Midlands. In its response to this Report, the DCMS should also detail how they will use these opportunities to showcase the wider social impact of investment in culture and sport, make the case for public investment in culture and sport, and work with local partners to champion lasting change.

135. Any further evaluation of major cultural or sporting events commissioned by the DCMS should include an assessment of whether the integrated approach used for these exceptional situations could and should be replicated in routine policymaking structures.

275 The National Trust [SCS0091] para 5, Swim England [SCS0199] and UK Sport [SCS0140] also reported higher levels of interest in sports facilities during the 2016 Games

276 Pandemonium Drummers [SCS0228] para 1.1

277 The Mayor of London [SCS0188] para 3.2

278 Q222

279 Q11

280 Q158

281 Spirit of 2012 [SCS0036] para 16

5 Maximising social impact

136. This report has looked at the particular examples and evidence that we received about the power of culture and the power of sport, but we also wanted to examine the commonality of issues facing organisations from both sectors in the current operating environment. This final chapter focuses on the policy levers and changes that could make a real difference to the contribution of culture and sport to health, education, criminal justice and other social issues.

Cross-government working

137. The genesis of this inquiry was a concern that, while cultural and sporting organisations are having positive impacts on their communities every day of the week, the full benefits are not being realised. Although the DCMS is the governmental ‘home’ of culture and sport, we were concerned that sufficient attention hasn’t been afforded across Government to maximise the contribution that sport and culture can make to a range of policy objectives. The concerns that we had were borne out by the evidence that we received.

138. Trinity Laban was one of a number of organisations to suggest that the Government has adopted a “silo mentality” to departmental responsibilities,²⁸² and the Paul Hamlyn Foundation commented that “governments of all persuasions and complex organisations struggle to move away from silo working”.²⁸³ There was also concerns about siloed thinking within Departments themselves, for example different strands to criminal justice commissioning.²⁸⁴ The Local Government Association noted that the lack of a joined-up approach nationally means that central government departments can be overly functional and prescriptive in their work with local authorities and other devolved bodies, therefore limiting co-ordination at a local level.²⁸⁵

139. We were able to secure oral evidence from five different Government ministers, from four departments, which is testament to their commitment to the cross-cutting issues that we have been examining in our inquiry. We are grateful to them for their willingness to engage beyond their usual departmental boundaries. The ministers pointed to a number of different initiatives where they work together with other departments, for example the DCMS supports the DfE on music education and both departments work with the Department of Health and Social Care on school sport.²⁸⁶ Edward Argar MP told us “it is hugely important that we are joined-up and I think that we are increasingly joined-up”.²⁸⁷ The DCMS also provided us with details of the inter-ministerial groups with which they are involved.²⁸⁸

282 Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance [[SCS0127](#)] para 5.1, see also New College Leicester [[SCS0029](#)] para 4.1, Children’s University [[SCS0035](#)] para 12

283 Paul Hamlyn Foundation [[SCS0012](#)] para 5.1

284 Clinks and the National Criminal Justice Arts Alliance and Clinks [[SCS0121](#)] para 4.2

285 The Local Government Association [[SCS0096](#)] para 5.1

286 Q271 [Nick Gibb MP]

287 Q271

288 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [[SCS0202](#)]

140. But we were still left with the impression that there is no overall cross-government approach to harnessing the benefits that can accrue from arts or sport. There is a difference between working together when opportunities arise on discrete initiatives, and leadership to champion and proactively drive the agenda forward together.

141. *During 2019, the DCMS should establish and lead a new standing inter-ministerial group on the social impact of sport and culture, using this as a platform to reset cross-government work with these sectors. The priorities for this new group should encompass the issues that we have identified in our report, including health, education, criminal justice and regeneration.*

142. While our inquiry was welcomed by both the cultural and sporting sectors, there was also a sense of frustration that previous efforts to quantify the social impact of culture and sport have not necessarily translated into a more co-ordinated approach.²⁸⁹ What Next? Newcastle Gateshead commented “what is the point of the mountains of research carried out by PhD students across the country into the impact of art, culture and sport on the health agenda when it then isn’t used to affect policy, practice and behaviour?”²⁹⁰ The Sport for Development Coalition suggested “where strong evidence already exists is it possible for Government Departments to recognise and accept the proven impact of sport and physical activity so that resources can concentrate on scaling up activities that work and plug the gaps where the evidence is weak?”²⁹¹

143. There was also concern about a perceived lack of institutional memory within Government,²⁹² including in respect of utilising recent comprehensive work to quantify the evidence base for arts and health.²⁹³ The evidence that we received made reference to a breadth of prior related work on this topic, some of which was funded and published by the Government itself²⁹⁴ and some of which has been initiated by the sector or by funders.²⁹⁵

144. *Rather than making any further calls to strengthen the evidence base for the social impact of culture and sport, we recommend that DCMS audit what has changed as a result of the work that they have already funded, or been involved in. The Department should work with charitable foundations, academics and others to comprehensively understand, and champion, the current evidence base, and publish their findings within the next 12 months.*

The power of football

145. During our inquiry we visited three football clubs to see the exceptional work that they are doing in their communities.

289 Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation [SCS0180] para 4 and 5

290 What next? Newcastle Gateshead [SCS0092] para 7

291 Sport for Development Coalition [SCS0214] para 14

292 For example, Paul Hamlyn Foundation [SCS0012] para 5.2, What Next? Newcastle Gateshead [SCS0092] para 4

293 Q213 [Dr Fancourt]

294 For example, the Department of Culture, Media and Sport led the Culture and Sport Evidence programme which published a comprehensive report on the social impacts of culture and sport in 2015. The DCMS also collaborates with Sport England, Arts Council England (ACE) and Historic England in co-funding the What Works Centre for Wellbeing, an independent, government funded organisation set up to produce robust, relevant and accessible evidence on wellbeing, including links with culture and sport. Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [SCS0202], Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport [SCS0259]

295 For example Big Lottery Fund [SCS0094], People’s Health Trust [SCS0152], Paul Hamlyn Foundation [SCS0012], Aidan Nicol [SCS0249]

146. We visited the Beacon of Light, a recently-opened sports, health, education and community space run by Sunderland AFC's Foundation of Light. As well as sports courts, the Beacon's facilities include a school for 13–16-year olds who are disengaged from mainstream education, a health and wellbeing zone to offer health services to visiting families, and a business centre to teach employability skills. The Beacon of Light estimate that they will generate £73 million worth of social impact over the next twenty years.²⁹⁶ More broadly, the Foundation of Light delivers 49 different community programmes across South Shields and County Durham, encompassing employment, health, education and sport. We were highly impressed with the Foundation of Light and its devoted staff. We saw for ourselves the opportunity for joy and new experiences that it was bringing for children and parents alike.

147. We visited the Etihad Campus, a large multi-purpose facility belonging to Manchester City Football Club. Leveraging the legacies of the 2002 Commonwealth Games and the 2012 Olympic and Paralympic Games, the site hosts nine national bodies of sport and four national sports centres. When the Campus was under construction, the Club ensured that 70% of all workers involved came from the local area and 86% of all materials used on to build the suite came from local companies. The construction also created 130 apprenticeships. During our visit to the Etihad Campus, we saw six separate football sessions taking part in the vast indoor facilities, with participants ranging from preschool-age children to retired people. These form part of the work of City in the Community, the club's charitable foundation.

148. At Old Trafford, we heard about the partnerships that Manchester United Football Club Foundation is building with local schools, delivering thousands of sessions in the local area that use football to inspire young people and raise their aspirations. In 2017/18 the Foundation worked with over 18,000 young people in the greater Manchester area, including partnering with 20 different high schools. Their work includes free football coaching, promoting understanding of healthy eating and the importance of physical exercise, and supporting school leavers on their pathway into training and employment. 'Inclusive Reds' is Manchester United Foundation's disability sport initiative, which worked with 150 players with disabilities in 2017/18.²⁹⁷

149. Kile, 27, was a participant at the Foundation's first ever Street Reds evening football project over 10 years ago. Street Reds uses the power of football to give young people aged 8–18 an opportunity to pursue their interest in playing, leading and coaching the game at any level. After attending college and university, Kile returned to Street Reds and has now progressed to a lead role within the primary schools team. Kile said: "where I come from there is a lot of unemployment, so I just want to make sure people are given opportunities and their talents are nurtured and pushed in the right direction, just like myself".

150. We also heard concerns that the unique power of sport has not been held in sufficient esteem by the Government. On our visit to Manchester, we saw the way that both Manchester City and Manchester United football clubs are harnessing the esteem of their brand to reach and engage young people, a sentiment also echoed by Premiership Rugby²⁹⁸ and Crawley Town Community Foundation.²⁹⁹ Alastair Campbell said:

296 This figure is based on a social return on investment model. There is further information about calculating social return on investment on the [Social Value UK website](#) [accessed on 30 April 2019]

297 www.mufoundation.org/en/About-Us

298 HITZ [SCS0250]

299 Crawley Town Community Foundation [SCS0118]

Let us be honest, in most communities, a sports brand has got more powerful access to that community than businesses, local MPs or whoever it might be. Sometimes the infrastructure is there and has nothing to do with Government or the local authority, but you just have to have [...] imagination to tie-up with it and get into that community.³⁰⁰

151. While the focus on achieving social outcomes through sport in the *Sporting Future* strategy has been welcomed by the sector,³⁰¹ there was scepticism in our evidence about the extent to which this has secured the buy-in from across Whitehall that is needed for the strategy to be successful. The England and Wales Cricket Board noted that “the Inter-Ministerial Group on Healthy Living³⁰² has yet to produce any output” and it said that “there is a need for more co-ordination with other important Departments of State”,³⁰³ and the Sport and Recreation Alliance commented “it remains questionable whether a genuine, coordinated approach to sports policy will be delivered”.³⁰⁴ Sports Minister Mims Davies MP told us that *Sporting Future* is “very much a cross-government strategy”³⁰⁵ and that she will be “refreshing” it during 2019.³⁰⁶

152. Linked to concern about how the sports strategy has fared, there was a broader concern that “sport is often viewed marginally by policy makers”.³⁰⁷ The England and Wales Cricket Board commented: “too often, it feels as though sport is a “Friday afternoon activity” across Government, not currently receiving the attention and impetus it merits”.³⁰⁸ John Herriman from Greenhouse Sports suggested that sport has been “effectively sidelined” within the education system³⁰⁹ and Alistair Campbell commented that successive governments have only “paid lip service” to the power of sport, rather than genuinely understanding the benefits it can bring.³¹⁰ He suggested that either a more senior or a more strategic sporting ministerial post is needed.³¹¹ Ms Davies told us “maybe a seismic shift at this point while we are working positively well together is not the place to go”.³¹²

153. The refreshed Sporting Future strategy is an ideal opportunity for the Sports Minister to truly galvanise cross-government involvement in maximising the social impact of sport. While we accept that machinery of Government changes may not be the right mechanism, we support the calls made during our inquiry for sport to have a higher profile across Whitehall. We recommend that the DCMS establishes a pan-

300 Q227

301 For example, Sport and Recreation Alliance [SCS0147] para 3.1, British Horseracing Authority [SCS0149] para 1.7, London Sport [SCS0222] para 8, Silverfit [SCS0231] para 3.13

302 During 2018 the Government established an Inter-Ministerial Group on Healthy Living, to be co-chaired by the Secretaries of State for DCMS and Health and Social Care, bringing together a range of departments to consider how sport and physical activity could be made more widely accessible, so that they benefit everyone. This is part of the implementation of the *Sporting Future* strategy. HM Government [Sporting Future: Second Annual Report](#) January 2018

303 England and Wales Cricket Board [SCS0107]

304 Sport and Recreation Alliance [SCS0147] para 3.1

305 Q272

306 Q302

307 Sport and Recreation Alliance [SCS0147] para 2

308 England and Wales Cricket Board [SCS0107]

309 Q17

310 Q180

311 Q180

312 Q272

department ministerial implementation taskforce for the refreshed Sporting Future strategy before the end of 2019. We expect to see further details of how this will operate in the Government's response to this Report.

Funding, commissioning and evaluation

154. Many of the initiatives that we heard about during our inquiry were funded through time-limited project resources,³¹³ which impacts both on their sustainability and their ability to effect long-term change. The Chartered Institute of Library and Information Professionals noted although “positive social impact is a long-term outcome”, the successful initiatives and projects in the library sector are in fact characterised by short-termism.³¹⁴ Professor Meek commented on the work of the Change Foundation who support girls in care who are at risk of ending up in the criminal justice system:

They use street football, rugby, cricket and any number of other sports. But they rely on short-term funding. They evaluate every programme they deliver and they know that they work, but they run out of money and have to go begging for small amounts of more cash to carry on with their work. They are in a precarious and vulnerable position, and all the organisations I have worked with in this sector are the same. They cannot plan for long-term provision because they are reliant on short-term funding to support their work.³¹⁵

155. Although there were many examples of tangible impact in our evidence, organisations had varying interpretations of what impact looks like, and what should be measured.³¹⁶ Arts Council England Chief Executive Darren Henley identified gaps in measurement data, which Arts Council England is proactively trying to fill, and noted that information should be collected “in the way that the recipient audience that we want to convince need to have it.”³¹⁷ Other sector initiatives have sought to bring an element of commonality to the diverse work of civil society organisations operating in this space, including the Association of Independent Museum’s Evidencing Social Impact Toolkit³¹⁸ and Sport England’s Evaluation Framework.³¹⁹ Spirit of 2012 told us “we explicitly and relentlessly focus our funding on achieving social outcomes, rather than viewing these as a by-product of sports, culture and associated volunteering, and we support our project partners to measure and articulate what that impact has been.”³²⁰ This can be a new experience for grantees who are accustomed to reporting on outputs rather than these broader outcomes.³²¹ Helen O’Donnell from Children’s University suggested that social impact should be measured through asking “the people that we want to be at the positive receiving end of that social impact. Let’s ask the children, the parents, the businesses, the communities, the cities and regions that we want this to impact on.”³²²

313 For example Birmingham City University [SCS0022] para 2, Bristol Reggae Orchestra [SCS0038] para 5

314 CILIP [SCS0040] para 31, a similar point was made by Making Music [SCS0050] para 8

315 Q137

316 HOME [SCS0077] para 6.1, Nesta [SCS0110] para 3.1

317 Q55

318 Brooklands Museum [SCS0039] para 3

319 Q25

320 Spirit of 2012 [SCS0036] para 2

321 Spirit of 2012 supplementary evidence [SCS0260]

322 Q258

156. The Public Services (Social Value) Act 2013 requires public sector commissioners to think about how they can secure wider social benefits from what they fund. In 2018, the Government moved to strengthen the provisions of the Act by requiring all central government departments to ‘account for’ the social value of new procurements rather than just ‘consider’ it.³²³ The DCMS is leading the way in applying social value in this way, with the rest of Government following their example. The Government also committed to exploring the use of social value in grants as well as contracts in the strategy. The British Standards Institution suggested to our inquiry that there could be a role for developing a new set of standards on assessing and supporting social value.³²⁴

157. The DCMS should conduct a review of the funding streams offered by Arts Council England, Sport England and other statutory bodies funding culture and sport organisations to explore if they can move to a more long-term and sustainable approach.

158. The work that the DCMS is leading to bring social value into central government commissioning should include explicit consideration of the social value delivered by cultural and sporting organisations. The Department should build on existing evaluation frameworks in the sectors and ensure that their social value work connects cultural and sports organisations more readily to commissioners.

323 HM Government [Civil Society Strategy: building a future that works for everyone](#) August 2018

324 British Standards Institution [[SCS0137](#)] para 6

Appendix 1: Research from young people

As part of our inquiry, we worked with the British Youth Council to invite young people to investigate cultural and sporting provision in their local area. Following an application process, we selected three young people who have been carrying out research into one cultural and one sporting provider operating in their area.

We asked the young researchers to look at what was on offer, how many people are reached, what social benefits accrue, any challenges facing the providers, how they engage harder to reach groups and what the Government could do to support the programmes they looked at. We held an informal discussion with the Chair to hear about their findings.

Aidan Nicol looked at Active Fusion and CAST Theatre in Doncaster.³²⁵ Samuel Cliff looked at Inspirational Leads and the Harrogate Girls football club.³²⁶ Sylvia Cullen looked at the Bambasini Project and Holy Rosary and Saint Anne's Choir School in Leeds.

We held an informal discussion with the Chair to hear about their findings. The discussion covered a broad range of issues including narrowing of the curriculum, the way that extra-curricular activities can inspire young people who may not be reached through formal education, rising concerns about the mental health of young people, and the benefits that sport and cultural participation can bring in terms of self-reflection.

325 Aidan Nicol [[SCS0249](#)]

326 Samuel Cliff [[SCS0252](#)]

Conclusions and recommendations

Breaking the cycle of crime

1. The Committee's visit to the Brandon Estate showed that communities often have a good understanding of the challenges they face, and the positive role that sport and culture can play in changing the life chances of young people. How then can we fund initiatives from the cash rich world of elite sport to support these organisations? *The Government should consider how funding can be made available to community initiatives and organisations to create targeted interventions to help young people who are risk of becoming involved in or the victims of criminal activity.* And experienced groups such as Clinks, a membership body for voluntary organisations in the criminal justice sector, might be well-placed to administer such a funding scheme, for instance. (Paragraph 17)
2. The delay in publishing the independent review of sport in youth and adult prisons demonstrates the precarious political capital invested in sport and criminal justice. The life-changing opportunities offered by sport like those afforded to John McAvoy cannot be left to chance. *There is a suspicion that Government is influenced still by wariness of press headlines suggesting that use of sport in the justice system is inappropriate. The Government must rebut robustly these suggestions. The Ministry of Justice should establish permanent cross-government structures to focus action on sport and criminal justice, and add this to the list of ministerial responsibilities in the Department.* (Paragraph 34)
3. *During 2019, the Government has committed to monitor progress on the recommendations made in Professor Meek's report. This work should involve both the MoJ and DCMS and also be subject to independent scrutiny. It is regrettable that coverage of this wide-ranging review was overshadowed by press leaks about one aspect—the potential role of boxing and martial arts in prisons. Rather than rejecting the suggestion out of hand, the review should also include a comprehensive evaluation of their place among other sports helping rehabilitation and stopping re-offending, both within the prison estate and in the community.* (Paragraph 35)
4. *Violent incidents in prisons appear to be at an all-time high and the report's recommendations reflect the need to consider alternative violence reduction strategies. Given the positive impact of boxing and martial arts programmes in our communities, as reflected in the evidence we have received, prison governors should be given the option of using similar approaches in their establishments, if they so wish. The review should also identify the measures needed to more systematically harness the significant contribution that sporting clubs are making to reducing reoffending in their communities. It is vital, in particular, that MoJ and HM Prison and Probation Service provides the leadership to make wide-ranging and high quality sports and physical education provision a reality—including effective liaison with local clubs and national initiatives—with a senior prison manager taking responsibility at each establishment.* (Paragraph 36)

5. In January, 2019, HM Prison and Probation Service updated its 'Strategic Review of Physical Education in Prisons'. Welcome as this was, this replicates a number of Professor Meek's recommendations, without acknowledging the 'A Sporting Chance' report at all. This is a missed opportunity to demonstrate joined-up working and underlines the importance of independent scrutiny to monitor substantive progress in the prison establishment. (Paragraph 37)
6. *The Ministry of Justice should work with the Home Office, DCMS, Department of Health and DfE to establish the best way to create a nationwide equivalent to the Mayor of London's map of activities for young people, which could help them to find sporting development opportunities and positive role models.* (Paragraph 38)
7. The DCMS has recognised the role of the arts in reducing reoffending, but the Department's activity in this area is far less developed than the work championing the role of sport in tackling criminality. This is despite the existence of the National Criminal Justice Arts Alliance, an umbrella organisation representing a large number of groups operating in this sphere. *We recommend the DCMS and MoJ jointly commission a review of arts in the prison estate, along a similar model to Professor Meek's review of sport in youth and adult prisons discussed in Chapter 2.* (Paragraph 47)
8. *The DCMS and Arts Council England should also work with cultural organisations, including National Portfolio organisations to collate and develop the evidence base for the role that the arts can play in behaviour change, reducing reoffending and rehabilitating offenders.* (Paragraph 48)

Creating opportunities through education

9. We are deeply concerned by the evidence we received around the downgrading of arts subjects in schools, with all the consequent implications for children's development, wellbeing, experiences, careers and, ultimately, life chances. It is not enough for the DCMS and DfE to simply expect schools to provide a 'broad and balanced curriculum': they need to take action to ensure that this is actually happening. The Government has not shied away from a prescriptive approach to other facets of education policy, for example specifying which times tables primary school children need to learn. (Paragraph 74)
10. There is also evidence from Wales that, with pressure on schools budgets, it is not just in England that down grading of arts subjects in schools has occurred and long established support for music services has declined in recent years. (Paragraph 75)
11. This is the area in our broad-ranging inquiry where there was the largest gap between government's policy intentions and statements and the lived experience of organisations submitting evidence. This gap urgently needs to be closed, including through a clear explanation from the DfE and the DCMS of the figures on cultural education that they hold, and why these seem to differ from those used by cultural organisations concerned about arts education. The DfE should also set out how schools can find out about inspirational approaches such as that taken by Feversham Primary Academy. (Paragraph 76)

12. The Education Minister told us that Ofsted will be ‘strengthening’ its inspection regime during 2019. *The DfE and DCMS should work alongside Ofsted to design an inspection regime for primary and secondary schools that measures the volume of cultural education; the integration of cultural education with other areas of the curriculum; and the universality of schools’ cultural offers in ensuring that all children have access to the benefits that cultural participation can bring. The DfE should make sure that case studies sharing the experiences and results of schools like Feversham are readily available for other headteachers and leaders in education.* (Paragraph 77)
13. The Minister for School Standards told us he wanted to see an increase in the number of pupils taking arts subjects at GCSE and A Level. *The best way to ensure that this happens is to add these subjects to the EBacc, as recommended in our recent Live Music Inquiry and by our predecessor committee in 2013 in its Supporting the Creative Economy inquiry.* (Paragraph 78)
14. We re-iterate the conclusions from our Live Music Report in respect of music education, in schools and through Music Hubs, and look forward to the Government’s response. We remain deeply concerned about the gap between the Government’s reassuring rhetoric and the evidence presented to us of the decline in music provision in state schools, for which the Ebacc is blamed and which affects students from less advantaged socio-economic backgrounds disproportionately. We commend, therefore, the work of the All Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education in pursuing these issues further and would welcome sight of the Government’s response to each of the 18 recommendations in its recent report ‘Music Education: State of the Nation’. (Paragraph 79)
15. Whilst high rates of childhood obesity, coupled with low levels of physical activity, are rightly the policy driver for sport in education, it is important for the DCMS to champion the wider benefits including tackling social exclusion, supporting employability and increasing educational attainment. (Paragraph 92)
16. *While we welcome the forthcoming school sport and activity action plan, the Government must ensure that this does not simply perpetuate existing fragmentation between school and out of school sport. The DCMS and DfE should also ensure the plan emphasises the wider benefits of sport to children and young people, and highlights best practice evidence.* (Paragraph 93)
17. *The Government should commit to extend funding for the Primary PE and Sport Premium beyond 2020. The DCMS and DfE should work with Ofsted to ensure that their new inspection framework assesses how this money is used to further the widest social impact that sport can have on children, as well as contributing to tackling childhood obesity.* (Paragraph 94)

Improving health and wellbeing

18. The full health impacts of cultural programmes are far from being reached. *The DCMS should take the opportunity of the expansion of social prescribing to work with the Department of Health and Social Care to test how far prescription of arts and sports interventions can be mainstreamed in the 23 areas; to develop closer links between commissioning decisions and arts and sports programmes and organisations; and to*

assess how self-reported wellbeing can be better integrated into health commissioning processes. At present, there appears to be little collection of evidence by Government of the cumulative benefit of cultural programmes, despite the enthusiasm of the organisations who have seen huge benefits. (Paragraph 106)

19. *The DCMS and DHSC should ensure that NHS England’s forthcoming outcomes framework and guidance on social prescribing includes information about the power of arts and sporting interventions to improve both physical and mental health, and work to extend the availability of cultural benefits to more people affected by such conditions. The DCMS should track the evidence base on cost effectiveness that develops as a result of the use of this guidance. (Paragraph 107)*
20. *We reiterate our earlier recommendation about the importance of Government support for social prescribing. We also recommend that DCMS approach sporting organisations to encourage their participation in social prescribing schemes, which can go beyond physical health benefits to include social impacts such as tackling loneliness. (Paragraph 117)*

Regenerating communities

21. *We heard about the success stories that City of Culture initiatives can generate, including additional funding from the DCMS, Arts Council England and other sources. But these initiatives shouldn’t just be limited to forward-thinking local authorities and communities. (Paragraph 126)*
22. *The bidding process for UK City of Culture is creating real benefits for the communities that take part, and not just for the winning entries. The Government should consider how towns and more rural communities can be incentivised to work together to develop strategies for culturally led regeneration. We welcome the recent suggestion of a “Town of Culture” award to extend to towns the proven concept of a cultural benefit to communities of artistic activity. (Paragraph 127)*
23. *Local Enterprise Partnerships should be required to identify opportunities for cultural and creative industries led regeneration as part of their local growth strategies. (Paragraph 128)*
24. *We recommend that DCMS commission organisations who have been in the vanguard of culture-based regeneration to produce detailed guidance and best practice for local authorities at city, town and borough levels on how they can leverage culture to revitalise their areas, irrespective of whether they have benefitted from specific funding to do so. (Paragraph 129)*
25. *Ahead of Coventry’s City of Culture in 2021 and the Birmingham Commonwealth Games in 2022, the DCMS should set out detailed policy and funding structures for building a lasting legacy in the West Midlands. In its response to this Report, the DCMS should also detail how they will use these opportunities to showcase the wider social impact of investment in culture and sport, make the case for public investment in culture and sport, and work with local partners to champion lasting change. (Paragraph 134)*

26. *Any further evaluation of major cultural or sporting events commissioned by the DCMS should include an assessment of whether the integrated approach used for these exceptional situations could and should be replicated in routine policymaking structures. (Paragraph 135)*

Maximising social impact

27. *During 2019, the DCMS should establish and lead a new standing inter-ministerial group on the social impact of sport and culture, using this as a platform to reset cross-government work with these sectors. The priorities for this new group should encompass the issues that we have identified in our report, including health, education, criminal justice and regeneration. (Paragraph 141)*
28. *Rather than making any further calls to strengthen the evidence base for the social impact of culture and sport, we recommend that DCMS audit what has changed as a result of the work that they have already funded, or been involved in. The Department should work with charitable foundations, academics and others to comprehensively understand, and champion, the current evidence base, and publish their findings within the next 12 months. (Paragraph 144)*
29. *The refreshed Sporting Future strategy is an ideal opportunity for the Sports Minister to truly galvanise cross-government involvement in maximising the social impact of sport. While we accept that machinery of Government changes may not be the right mechanism, we support the calls made during our inquiry for sport to have a higher profile across Whitehall. We recommend that the DCMS establishes a pan-department ministerial implementation taskforce for the refreshed Sporting Future strategy before the end of 2019. We expect to see further details of how this will operate in the Government's response to this Report. (Paragraph 153)*
30. *The DCMS should conduct a review of the funding streams offered by Arts Council England, Sport England and other statutory bodies funding culture and sport organisations to explore if they can move to a more long-term and sustainable approach. (Paragraph 157)*
31. *The work that the DCMS is leading to bring social value into central government commissioning should include explicit consideration of the social value delivered by cultural and sporting organisations. The Department should build on existing evaluation frameworks in the sectors and ensure that their social value work connects cultural and sports organisations more readily to commissioners. (Paragraph 158)*

Formal minutes

Tuesday 7 May 2019

Damian Collins, in the Chair

Clive Efford

Ian C Lucas

Simon Hart

Brendan O'Hara

Julian Knight

Rebecca Pow

Draft Report (*Changing Lives: the social impact of participation in culture and sport*), proposed by the Chairman, brought up and read.

Ordered, That the draft Report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph.

Paragraphs 1 to 158 read and agreed to.

Summary agreed to.

Appendix agreed to.

Resolved, That the Report be the Eleventh Report of the Committee to the House.

Ordered, That the Chair make the Report to the House.

Ordered, That embargoed copies of the Report be made available, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order No.134.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 8 May 2019 at 2.00 p.m.]

Witnesses

The following witnesses gave evidence. Transcripts can be viewed on the [inquiry publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

Tuesday 19 June 2018

Darren Henley, Chief Executive, Arts Council England, **John Herriman**, Chief Executive, Greenhouse Sports, and **Deborah Williams**, Executive Director, Creative Diversity Network

[Q1–61](#)

Tuesday 3 July 2018

John McAvoy, Professional Athlete, **Dr Phillip Lee MP**, and **Professor Rosie Meek**, Professor of Criminal Psychology, Royal Holloway University

[Q62–150](#)

Tuesday 10 July 2018

Rebecca Ball, Director, Sunderland City of Culture 2021, **Dr Beatriz Garcia**, Director of the Institute of Culture Capital, and **Rosie Millard OBE**, Chief Executive, Children and the Arts, and Former Chair, Hull City of Culture 2017

[Q151–177](#)

Tuesday 16 October 2018

Alastair Campbell, mental health campaigner, **Dr Daisy Fancourt**, Senior Research Associate, Institute of Epidemiology and Health Care, University College London, and **Susannah Hall**, Head of Arts, Great Ormond Street Hospital for Children NHS Trust

[Q178–227](#)

Wednesday 14 November 2018

Naveed Idrees, Headteacher, Feversham Primary Academy, **Debbie Lye**, Chief Executive, Spirit of 2012 Trust, and **Helen O'Donnell**, Chief Executive, Children's University

[Q228–270](#)

Wednesday 12 December 2018

Edward Argar MP, Parliamentary Under Secretary of State, Ministry of Justice, **Steve Brine MP**, Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Public Health and Primary Care, **Mims Davies MP**, Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Sport and Civil Society, **Michael Ellis MP**, Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Arts, Heritage and Tourism, and **Rt Hon Nick Gibb MP**, Minister of State for School Standards

[Q271–347](#)

Published written evidence

The following written evidence was received and can be viewed on the [inquiry publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

SCS numbers are generated by the evidence processing system and so may not be complete.

- 1 2nd Chance Group CIC ([SCS0117](#))
- 2 A New Direction ([SCS0071](#))
- 3 Access Creative College ([SCS0051](#))
- 4 Action for Children's Arts ([SCS0037](#))
- 5 Action with Communities in Rural England ([SCS0219](#))
- 6 Aesop Arts & Society Limited ([SCS0002](#))
- 7 Age UK ([SCS0045](#))
- 8 All-Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing ([SCS0078](#))
- 9 The Architectural Heritage Fund ([SCS0016](#))
- 10 Art Fund ([SCS0185](#))
- 11 Artlink West Yorkshire ([SCS0208](#))
- 12 Arts & Health South West ([SCS0174](#))
- 13 Arts Council England ([SCS0235](#))
- 14 Arts for Health at Manchester Metropolitan University ([SCS0089](#))
- 15 Arvon ([SCS0189](#))
- 16 Ashira Singers ([SCS0013](#))
- 17 Association of British Orchestras ([SCS0112](#))
- 18 BALTIC Centre for Contemporary Art ([SCS0063](#))
- 19 Barbican ([SCS0124](#))
- 20 Baring Foundation ([SCS0023](#))
- 21 Barnsley Museums ([SCS0229](#))
- 22 Battersea Arts Centre ([SCS0087](#))
- 23 BBC ([SCS0093](#))
- 24 Being Human festival ([SCS0049](#))
- 25 Bell, Mr Pete ([SCS0247](#))
- 26 Big Lottery Fund ([SCS0094](#))
- 27 Birmingham City University supplementary ([SCS0022](#))
- 28 BookTrust ([SCS0179](#))
- 29 BOP Consulting ([SCS0193](#))
- 30 BPI ([SCS0213](#))
- 31 Bristol Culture ([SCS0069](#))
- 32 Bristol Reggae Orchestra ([SCS0038](#))
- 33 The British Association for Shooting and Conservation ([SCS0220](#))

- 34 British Film Institute (BFI) ([SCS0159](#))
- 35 British Horse Society ([SCS0243](#))
- 36 British Horseracing Authority ([SCS0149](#))
- 37 British Paralympic Association ([SCS0135](#))
- 38 British Standards Institution ([SCS0137](#))
- 39 Brooklands Museum ([SCS0039](#))
- 40 Brunel University London ([SCS0101](#))
- 41 Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation ([SCS0180](#))
- 42 Camelot UK Lotteries Ltd ([SCS0197](#))
- 43 CAMEo Research Institute for Cultural and Media Economies, University of Leicester ([SCS0076](#))
- 44 Canal & River Trust ([SCS0172](#))
- 45 Centre for Performance Science, Royal College of Music and Imperial College London ([SCS0187](#))
- 46 Charlton Athletic Community Trust ([SCS0153](#))
- 47 Charnwood Arts ([SCS0068](#))
- 48 Chatterjee, Professor Helen ([SCS0201](#))
- 49 Children & the Arts ([SCS0130](#))
- 50 Children's University ([SCS0035](#))
- 51 Children's University supplementary evidence ([SCS0254](#))
- 52 Choi Kwang Do, Ashington ([SCS0033](#))
- 53 CILIP ([SCS0040](#))
- 54 Clare, Roy ([SCS0031](#))
- 55 Cliff, Samuel ([SCS0252](#))
- 56 Clinks and the National Criminal Justice Arts Alliance ([SCS0121](#))
- 57 CLOSER ([SCS0139](#))
- 58 ConnectSport ([SCS0186](#))
- 59 Contact ([SCS0126](#))
- 60 Contemporary Visual Arts Network ([SCS0083](#))
- 61 Cook, Mrs Karen ([SCS0074](#))
- 62 Countryside Alliance ([SCS0088](#))
- 63 Cox and Jill Robinson, Mr Martin ([SCS0133](#))
- 64 Crafts Council ([SCS0034](#))
- 65 Crawley Town Community Foundation ([SCS0118](#))
- 66 Create ([SCS0234](#))
- 67 Crossick, Professor Geoffrey ([SCS0198](#))
- 68 The Cultural Learning Alliance ([SCS0171](#))
- 69 The Cultural Spring ([SCS0081](#))
- 70 Culture & Wellbeing York ([SCS0158](#))

- 71 Culture Counts ([SCS0141](#))
- 72 Culture Matters ([SCS0194](#))
- 73 Culture, King's College London ([SCS0233](#))
- 74 Culture, Media & Creative Industries (CMCI), King's College London ([SCS0167](#))
- 75 DanceSyndrome ([SCS0104](#))
- 76 The Daytones ([SCS0020](#))
- 77 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport ([SCS0202](#))
- 78 Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport ([SCS0259](#))
- 79 Department for Education ([SCS0257](#))
- 80 Department of Health and Social Care ([SCS0256](#))
- 81 Doncaster Culture & Leisure Trust ([SCS0129](#))
- 82 Dr Jen Dyer, University of Leeds, Dr Rachel Sandford, Loughborough University, and Martino Corazza, IMAS ([SCS0079](#))
- 83 Dronfield Singers ([SCS0017](#))
- 84 Durham University ([SCS0245](#))
- 85 Earlyarts ([SCS0108](#))
- 86 EFL Trust ([SCS0102](#))
- 87 Elizabeth Costello, Development Director for Leigh Film Society CIC ([SCS0237](#))
- 88 Engage, the National Association for Gallery Education ([SCS0156](#))
- 89 England and Wales Cricket Board ([SCS0107](#))
- 90 English Federation of Disability Sport ([SCS0166](#))
- 91 Equity ([SCS0184](#))
- 92 Esmee Fairbairn Foundation ([SCS0142](#))
- 93 European Opera Centre ([SCS0168](#))
- 94 Exeter Bach Society ([SCS0075](#))
- 95 Fancourt, Dr Daisy ([SCS0248](#))
- 96 Fight for Peace ([SCS0138](#))
- 97 Fleetwood Town Community Trust ([SCS0006](#))
- 98 Football 4 Peace International ([SCS0106](#))
- 99 Fulham Reach Boat Club ([SCS0255](#))
- 100 Fun Palaces ([SCS0085](#))
- 101 Furthest from the Sea Music, Comedy & Arts, CIC ([SCS0236](#))
- 102 Fusion Lifestyle ([SCS0146](#))
- 103 The Golf Foundation ([SCS0216](#))
- 104 Great Ormond Street Hospital for Children NHS Trust ([SCS0010](#))
- 105 Greenhouse Sports ([SCS0163](#))
- 106 Hampshire Cultural Trust ([SCS0116](#))
- 107 Henon, Mr Andrew ([SCS0082](#))

- 108 The Heritage Alliance ([SCS0095](#))
- 109 Heritage Lottery Fund ([SCS0154](#))
- 110 High Peak Community Arts ([SCS0062](#))
- 111 Historic England ([SCS0169](#))
- 112 Historic Houses Association ([SCS0098](#))
- 113 Historic Royal Palaces ([SCS0055](#))
- 114 Historic Royal Palaces supplementary ([SCS0056](#))
- 115 HITZ ([SCS0250](#))
- 116 HOME ([SCS0077](#))
- 117 Hull UK City of Culture 2017 ([SCS0190](#))
- 118 Incorporated Society of Musicians ([SCS0253](#))
- 119 Independent Street Arts Network ([SCS0024](#))
- 120 Institute of Conservation ([SCS0097](#))
- 121 Into Film ([SCS0227](#))
- 122 Into Opera ([SCS0224](#))
- 123 Jerwood Charitable Foundation ([SCS0230](#))
- 124 Jones, Dr Julia ([SCS0084](#))
- 125 King's Head Theatre ([SCS0176](#))
- 126 Kirklees Council Comoodle Project ([SCS0232](#))
- 127 Kodaly Violin School ([SCS0207](#))
- 128 Lawn Tennis Association & Tennis Foundation ([SCS0226](#))
- 129 LIME Music for Health ([SCS0042](#))
- 130 Live Music Exchange (Newcastle University) ([SCS0218](#))
- 131 Liverpool County Football Association ([SCS0113](#))
- 132 Living Streets ([SCS0021](#))
- 133 The Local Government Association ([SCS0096](#))
- 134 London Children's Ballet ([SCS0173](#))
- 135 London Sport ([SCS0222](#))
- 136 London Youth ([SCS0145](#))
- 137 Lord's Taverners ([SCS0011](#))
- 138 The Lowry Centre Trust ([SCS0122](#))
- 139 Making Music ([SCS0050](#))
- 140 Manchester Metropolitan University ([SCS0178](#))
- 141 The Mayor of London ([SCS0188](#))
- 142 MB Associates ([SCS0109](#))
- 143 Midlands TUC Creative and Leisure Industries Committee ([SCS0205](#))
- 144 Miles, Professor Andrew ([SCS0204](#))
- 145 Ministry of Justice ([SCS0258](#))

- 146 Music Education Council ([SCS0080](#))
- 147 Musicians' Union ([SCS0057](#))
- 148 National Alliance for Museums, Health and Wellbeing ([SCS0200](#))
- 149 The National Foundation for Youth Music ([SCS0150](#))
- 150 National Museum Directors' Council and the Museums Association ([SCS0131](#))
- 151 National Museums Liverpool ([SCS0073](#))
- 152 National Theatre ([SCS0164](#))
- 153 The National Trust ([SCS0091](#))
- 154 National Youth Theatre of Great Britain ([SCS0114](#))
- 155 Natural History Museum ([SCS0192](#))
- 156 Nesta ([SCS0110](#))
- 157 New College Leicester ([SCS0029](#))
- 158 Nick Ewbank Associates ([SCS0119](#))
- 159 Nicol, Aidan ([SCS0249](#))
- 160 No 11 Arts ([SCS0065](#))
- 161 Nockolds, Mr Ian ([SCS0144](#))
- 162 Norfolk County Council ([SCS0183](#))
- 163 Nottingham Contemporary ([SCS0048](#))
- 164 Nottingham Music Service ([SCS0246](#))
- 165 Octavia ([SCS0111](#))
- 166 Old Royal Naval College ([SCS0007](#))
- 167 One Dance UK ([SCS0086](#))
- 168 Orchestras for All ([SCS0151](#))
- 169 Oxley, Mr Neil ([SCS0018](#))
- 170 Pandemonium Drummers ([SCS0228](#))
- 171 Park Palace Ponies ([SCS0027](#))
- 172 parkrun UK ([SCS0242](#))
- 173 Paul Hamlyn Foundation ([SCS0012](#))
- 174 People Dancing ([SCS0115](#))
- 175 People United ([SCS0181](#))
- 176 People's Health Trust ([SCS0152](#))
- 177 Peterborough Choral Society ([SCS0014](#))
- 178 Pinnock, Andrew ([SCS0223](#))
- 179 Premier League ([SCS0134](#))
- 180 Pro Bono Economics ([SCS0241](#))
- 181 Professor Eric Anderson, University of Winchester, Dr Rory Magrath, Solent University, Southampton, Dr Adam J. White, University of Bedfordshire, Dr Rachael Bullingham, University of Worcester, Dr Ryan Scoats, Birmingham City University, and Professor Mark McCormack, Roehampton University ([SCS0044](#))

- 182 Provident Financial ([SCS0054](#))
- 183 Rand MBE, Mr Julian Dennis ([SCS0008](#))
- 184 Read, Will ([SCS0251](#))
- 185 Reeves and Dr Robert De Vries, Dr Aaron ([SCS0209](#))
- 186 Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council's Arts Service ([SCS0132](#))
- 187 Rhythmix (Music in Mind) ([SCS0059](#))
- 188 Rhythmix (Wishing Well) ([SCS0060](#))
- 189 Roundhouse ([SCS0215](#))
- 190 The Royal Central School of Speech and Drama ([SCS0210](#))
- 191 Royal Opera House Bridge ([SCS0191](#))
- 192 Royal Shakespeare Company ([SCS0123](#))
- 193 Said Foundation ([SCS0099](#))
- 194 Scene & Heard ([SCS0043](#))
- 195 Science Museum Group ([SCS0157](#))
- 196 Sense ([SCS0162](#))
- 197 Shakespeare Birthplace Trust ([SCS0155](#))
- 198 Shakespeare Schools Foundation ([SCS0161](#))
- 199 Sheffield Performer and Audience Research Centre, University of Sheffield ([SCS0030](#))
- 200 Show Culture Some Love ([SCS0206](#))
- 201 Silverfit ([SCS0231](#))
- 202 Siobhan Davies Dance ([SCS0103](#))
- 203 Skippko Arts Team ([SCS0046](#))
- 204 Society of Authors ([SCS0240](#))
- 205 Southbank Centre ([SCS0196](#))
- 206 Spare Tyre Theatre Company ([SCS0067](#))
- 207 Spice Time Credits ([SCS0136](#))
- 208 Spirit of 2012 ([SCS0036](#))
- 209 Spirit of 2012 supplementary ([SCS0260](#))
- 210 Sport and Recreation Alliance ([SCS0147](#))
- 211 Sport for Development Coalition ([SCS0214](#))
- 212 Sported Foundation ([SCS0072](#))
- 213 The Sports and Recreation Trusts Association ([SCS0148](#))
- 214 Step Up To Serve ([SCS0061](#))
- 215 Stevens and Dr Sara Hubrich , Dr Fiona ([SCS0160](#))
- 216 Street League ([SCS0066](#))
- 217 StreetGames ([SCS0064](#))
- 218 Streetwise Opera ([SCS0100](#))
- 219 Stubbs, Mike ([SCS0026](#))

- 220 Swim England ([SCS0199](#))
- 221 ThinkForward ([SCS0125](#))
- 222 TLANG Project ([SCS0032](#))
- 223 Together TV ([SCS0221](#))
- 224 Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music & Dance ([SCS0127](#))
- 225 Tyne & Wear Archives & Museums ([SCS0211](#))
- 226 UK Music ([SCS0165](#))
- 227 UK Sport ([SCS0140](#))
- 228 UK Theatre /Society of London Theatre ([SCS0182](#))
- 229 ukactive ([SCS0128](#))
- 230 Ukie - UK Interactive Entertainment ([SCS0244](#))
- 231 University of Arts London ([SCS0217](#))
- 232 University of Newcastle ([SCS0195](#))
- 233 University of the West of England ([SCS0203](#))
- 234 Van de Vyver and Professor Dominic Abrams, Dr Julie ([SCS0120](#))
- 235 VCM Foundation ([SCS0177](#))
- 236 Voluntary Arts ([SCS0090](#))
- 237 Welsh Government ([SCS0009](#))
- 238 What Next? ([SCS0170](#))
- 239 What Next? Newcastle Gateshead ([SCS0092](#))
- 240 Wight Harmony ([SCS0028](#))
- 241 With One Voice ([SCS0212](#))
- 242 Yorkshire Sculpture Park ([SCS0025](#))
- 243 Youth Charter ([SCS0053](#))
- 244 Youth Sport Trust ([SCS0047](#))

List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament

All publications from the Committee are available on the [publications page](#) of the Committee's website. The reference number of the Government's response to each Report is printed in brackets after the HC printing number.

Session 2017–19

First Report	Appointment of the Chair of Ofcom	HC 508
Second Report	The potential impact of Brexit on the creative industries, tourism and the digital single market	HC 365 (HC 1141)
Third Report	Appointment of the Chair of the Charity Commission	HC 509 (HC 908)
Fourth Report	Combatting doping in sport	HC 366 (HC 1050)
Fifth Report	Disinformation and 'fake news': Interim Report	HC 363 (HC 1630)
Sixth Report	BBC Annual Report and Accounts 2017–18: Equal pay at the BBC	HC 993
Seventh Report	BBC Annual Report and Accounts 2017–18: Equal Pay at the BBC: BBC Response to the Committee's Sixth Report of Session 2017–19	HC 1875
Eighth Report	Disinformation and 'fake news': Final Report	HC 1791
Ninth Report	Live Music	HC 733
Tenth Report	The launch of the Sub-Committee on Disinformation	HC 2090
First Special Report	Appointment of the Chair of the Charity Commission: Government Response to the Committee's Third Report of Session 2017–19	HC 908
Second Special Report	Combatting doping in sport: Government Response to the Committee's Fourth Report of Session 2017–19	HC 1050
Third Special Report	Failure of a witness to answer an Order of the Committee: conduct of Mr Dominic Cummings	HC 1115
Fourth Special Report	The potential impact of Brexit on the creative industries, tourism and the digital single market: Government Response to the Committee's Second Report of Session 2017–19	HC 1141
Fifth Special Report	Disinformation and 'fake news': Government Response to the Committee's Fifth Report of Session 2017–19	HC 1630
Seventh Special Report	Disinformation and 'fake news': Final Report: Government Response to the Committee's Eighth Report of Session 2017–19	HC 2184